

## LOK SABHA

---

### SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES\* (Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

---

Tuesday, July 9, 2019 / Ashadha 18, 1941 (Saka)

---

#### SUBMISSION BY MEMBER

*Re: Allegedly engineering defection which is detrimental to the health of Parliamentary democracy.*

**THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS; MINISTER OF COAL AND MINISTER OF MINES (SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI)** *responding to the issue raised by an hon. Member, said:* Hon. Speaker, Sir, as per the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, a Member cannot raise the same matter again in any form. Even according to Kaul and Shakhder, a matter which has already been discussed by the House during the same Session cannot be raised again through the Adjournment Motion or by any other motion. I want to clarify that they have already raised the issue and the hon. Deputy Leader and the hon. Minister of Defence has responded to it. As far as the Government at the

---

\* Hon. Members may kindly let us know immediately the choice of language (Hindi or English) for obtaining Synopsis of Lok Sabha Debates.

Centre is concerned, we do not have any role as far as the Karnataka issue is concerned. I appeal to them not to disturb the House.

**THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI RAJ NATH SINGH)** *also responding said:* Hon. Speaker, Sir, exhibiting your generosity, you allowed to raise the issue again which had already been raised in this very Session but they have misused your generosity. Whatever has happened in Karnataka, is the internal matter of the Congress Party but they are attempting to disturb this House which cannot be justified at all.

---

#### **OBSERVATION BY THE SPEAKER**

**HON. SPEAKER:** Hon. Members, you had moved the Motion of Adjournment. I had disapproved your Motion of Adjournment while disposing of the Motions of Adjournment. I have given the opportunity to all the hon. Members to speak in the House even out of turn. Therefore, please don't resort to sloganeering and raising placards in the House. You can debate, discuss and have dialogue as much as you can. This House belongs to everyone. I, therefore, urge you to maintain the dignity and decorum of the House.

**\*MATTERS UNDER RULE 377**

- (1) **SHRI KIRTI VARDHAN SINGH** laid a statement regarding supply of surplus water from Tikri Minor canal of Saryu Nahar Pariyojana-Phase II to Aranga reservoir in Gonda Parliamentary Constituency, Uttar Pradesh.
- (2) **SHRI MITESH RAMESHBHAI PATEL** laid a statement regarding need to make Mahisagar river in Anand, Gujarat pollution free.
- (3) **SHRI DEVENDRA SINGH 'BHOLE'** laid a statement regarding setting up of Trauma Centre level-I at Lala Lajpat Rai Hospital attached with Kanpur Medical College, Uttar Pradesh.
- (4) **SHRI SUKHBIR SINGH JAUNAPURIA** laid a statement regarding need to declare Eastern Rajasthan Canal Project as project of national importance.
- (5) **DR. NISHIKANT DUBEY** laid a statement regarding need to set up Kendriya Vidyalayas in Santhal Pargana region.
- (6) **SHRI VISHNU DATT SHARMA** laid a statement regarding need to expedite construction of Majhgay dam project in Madhya Pradesh.
- (7) **SHRI AJAY MISRA TENI** laid a statement regarding delimitation of Assembly constituencies in Jammu & Kashmir.

---

\* Laid on the Table as directed by the Speaker/Chair

- (8) **SHRI SATYADEV PACHAURI** laid a statement regarding appointments on compassionate ground.
- (9) **SHRI SUNIL BABURAO MENDHE** laid a statement regarding need to start flight services from Gondia Airport under UDAN scheme.
- (10) **SHRI RAKESH SINGH** laid a statement regarding need to expedite electrification of Itarasi - Allahabad railway route.
- (11) **SHRI JANARDAN SINGH SIGRIWAL** laid a statement regarding need to include Bhojpuri language in Eighth Schedule to the Constitution.
- (12) **DR. (PROF.) KIRIT PREMJBHAI SOLANKI** laid a statement regarding providing corpus fund for the creation of an SC/ST bank.
- (13) **SHRI RAJENDRA AGRAWAL** laid a statement regarding need to provide rail link between Meerut and Panipat.
- (14) **SHRI AJAY NISHAD** laid a statement regarding need to declare Gandhi Ashram in Vaishali district, Bihar as National Heritage.
- (15) **SHRI KAUSHAL KISHORE** laid a statement regarding need to fill up backlog vacancies meant for SCs/STs in Central Government Offices and Departments.

- (16) **SHRI RAJU BISTA** laid a statement regarding need to ensure Minimum Wages Act is applicable to Tea Garden workers.
- (17) **ADV. DEAN KURIAKOSE** laid a statement regarding wild animals menace.
- (18) **SHRI BENNY BEHANAN** laid a statement regarding implementation of POCSO Act.
- (19) **DR. MOHAMMAD JAWED** laid a statement regarding funds for AMU Kishanganj Campus, Bihar.
- (20) **SHRI A.K.P CHINRAJ** laid a statement regarding need to provide better rail connectivity to Namakkal in Tamil Nadu.
- (21) **PROF. SOUGATA RAY** laid a statement regarding transfer of Government assets to private hands.
- (22) **SHRI LAVU SRIKRISHNA DEVARAYALU** laid a statement regarding Varikapudisala Lift Irrigation Project in Andhra Pradesh.
- (23) **DR. SHRIKANT EKNATH SHINDE** laid a statement regarding setting up of Post Office Passport Seva Kendra at Dombivali in Maharashtra.
- (24) **SHRI DINESH CHANDRA YADAV** laid a statement regarding gauge conversion of railway lines between Banmankhi and Bihariganj in Bihar.

- (25) **DR. G. RANJITH REDDY** laid a statement regarding setting up of Red Gram Board in Tandur region of Telangana.
- (26) **SHRI M SELVARAJ** laid a statement regarding providing financial assistance to farmers who were hard hit by cyclone Gaja.
- (27) **SHRI N.K. PREMACHANDRAN** laid a statement regarding need to put in place safety measures for Kollam bypass in Kerala.
- (28) **SHRI CHANDRA PRAKASH CHOUDHARY** laid a statement regarding need to establish a Tourism University in Parasnath Hills in Giridih parliamentary constituency and promote tourism in the region.

---

**UNION BUDGET- 2019-2020 - GENERAL DISCUSSION-*CONTD.***

**SHRI VIRENDRA SINGH:** For the first time, the farmers have confidence that this Government does what it says. The Parliament has enacted a law to provide remunerative prices for the produce of the farmers. For the first time ever, a Government has decided to deposit Rs.6000 in the accounts of the farmers. Some people say that it is very less. Only those people who have never given even 6 paise to the farmers speak like this. This is the first Government which has decided to provide subsidy to the farmers on cow dung manure. Water

conservation work has been started on priority basis. Morwa river had dried out but with the help of officials I have made water flow in it. Today, water has become polluted. If all the Members of Parliament will get ponds dug out in their constituencies and maintain the natural flow of water then no water will remain polluted. I have started this work in Ballia. Surah Taal is a world famous lake where I am going to start the digging work. After a long time, a Prime Minister has provided smokeless gas stove and toilet at home for the women of the country. This budget is a budget to make India rich in the future and to meet the challenges of the present. This Government is dedicated to the villages, poor, farmers and jawans. A 'Panchayat Vimarsh Kendra' is being set up in the village of Loknayak Jai Prakash Narayan. The income of the farmers will be doubled by the year 2022. In the Indian democracy the Government, the administration and the society can make the country rich by their combined efforts.

**SHRI NAMA NAGESWARA RAO:** I congratulate Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman ji for being the first South Indian woman to present the Union Budget. But, provisions in this budget for the development of the Southern States have not been made the way it was expected. We hope that the new Jal Shakti Ministry will look at the management of our water resources and water supply in an integrated and holistic manner and will work with the States to ensure 'Har Ghar Jal'. For the first time in India, 'Har Ghar Jal' has been provided by Telangana

State. We are providing filtered water to every house. Rs.6000 have not been deposited in the accounts of the farmers so far. Our State Government is the first in the entire country which has provided Rs.10000 per acre to the farmers. The coverage of 'Arogya Shree' scheme is much more than the coverage of 'Ayushman Bharat'. If both States and Centre work together, only then our economy will reach the 5 trillion mark. We are ahead of all the States in the country as far as GDP is concerned. Telangana leads the country with 14.9 per cent GDP. But there is not much provision for us in the Budget. I request that Railway Coach Factory, Four lane project etc. should be included in it.

**SHRI VINOD KUMAR SONKAR:** A question has been raised by the opposition as to how our country will be having a 5 trillion economy. I would like to remind the opposition that with the hon. Prime Minister at the helm, nothing is impossible. I would like to congratulate the hon. Minister that the Government has recovered more than Rs. one lakh crore of NPA from the defaulters. Around 9.60 crore toilets have been constructed in the country. This matter directly pertains to the respect of our women folk. The Government has made available the basic facilities to the poor like housing, pure fuel and medical treatment etc. I would like to request the hon. Minister to frame a national policy on outsourcing so that the exploitation of our youth could be stopped. I would also like to request that the Government should identify the industrially backward districts of the country and



take steps to promote industries in those districts. I will also request that the Government should take action expeditiously on its plan to provide piped drinking water in all the districts.

**SHRI RAMCHANDRA PASWAN:** My Parliamentary Constituency lie in a remote and inaccessible region. A number of railway projects are under construction in my Constituency but their execution is very slow. Our country has a large number of youths and we need to think about them seriously. The Government need to take speedy action on its plan to implement the piped water scheme. I would like to request to get the Sakri Hasan railway line project completed. The Government is also requested to get the highway related projects in my Constituency completed at the earliest.

**\*SHRI A. GANESHAMURTHI:**

**\*SHRI H. VASANTHAKUMAR:**

**\*SHRI S.R. PARTHIBAN:**

**\*DR. (PROF.) KIRIT PREMJI BHAI SOLANKI:**

**\*SHRIMATI PRATIMA MONDAL:**

---

\* Please see supplement.

**SHRI NANDKUMAR SINGH CHAUHAN:** This budget is likely to fulfil the aspirations of our country. The Government has targetted to provide 80 million free gas connections in the near future. It is an ambitious target. The Government has fulfilled the dream of the poor people by providing them houses. The Government has been providing financial assistance through direct benefit transfer and it has led to the end of the middlemen. The Government has launched a number of schemes like Shram Yogi Pension Yojana, Kisan Samman Nidhi, Kisan Pension Yojana, Karmyogi Pension Yojana etc to raise the standard of living of the common man. The Government has also formulated an action plan for water harvesting. It has also made a provision under the scheme to supply piped water to every household. For all these things, I congratulate the hon. Prime Minister and the hon. Finance Minister.

**\*SHRIMATI RANJANBEN BHATT:**

**\*SHRI MITESH RAMESHBHAI PATEL:**

**SHRIMATI PRENEET KAUR:** This is perhaps the first time that a Finance Minister has failed to make an announcement on the issues of Defence in the Budget Speech. The total outlay of Defence is up by a meagre 10 per cent. Adjusted for inflation, it means that we are spending less than even last year.

---

\* Please see supplement.

Expenditure in Animal Husbandry and Dairying is lower by about 11 per cent compared to the previous year. We are talking of 'Digital India' but it is up by just four per cent. As per the 14th Finance Commission, States are entitled to a share of 42 per cent of the Central Taxes. The entire increase in tax on petroleum and diesel this year will go to the Centre alone. This has been budgeted to give a revenue of Rs.1,27,019 crore in 2019-20. The figures in the case of corporate tax are up from Rs.37000 crore in 2017-18 to Rs.109000 crore. The Budget proposes to tax them at 42 per cent and the share of the States is being reduced from the promised 42 per cent to almost 30 per cent. Instead of raising money as surcharges and cesses, if it is collected as the main tax itself, this would entail sharing of at least Rs.2 lakh crore with the States. The disinvestment target of more than Rs.1 lakh crore is proposed as if everything were for ready sale. GDP has slowed down to 5.8 per cent in the previous quarter. Exports are stagnant for five years. Unemployment rate has doubled and investment climate is falling. These are hardly the signs of a good budget.

**\*SHRI AJAY MISRA TENI:**

**SHRIMATI SUNITA DUGGAL:** Be it old age pension or scholarships or LPG connection, whichever contained subsidy had earlier inescapable role of intermediaries which has become a thing of the past leading to the savings of

---

\* Please see supplement.

crores of rupees on this count. Our economy has made rapid strides from 1.85 trillion dollar in the year 2014 to 2.7 trillion dollar in 2019 and is poised to touch 5 trillion dollar down the line. Under the Pradhan Mantri Grameen Sadak Yojana waste plastic is to be used under road green technology for road construction on a stretch of 30 thousand kilometers. One lakh twenty five thousand kilometers of road construction is planned over the next 5 years. Under Udaan Scheme small towns are being connected with air services. Multi-purpose National Common Mobility Card would be of huge benefit to the people at large. Under Sagarmala Project, water ways shall be improved upon and with the creation of dependable inland water ways, people would be relieved of road and rail congestion. Crores of rupees have been transferred into the farmers' accounts. Under 'Khelo India Scheme' National Sports Education Board has been set up. Precisely put, our Government has done a spectacular job in water, on land and even in space.

**SHRI A. RAJA:** A lot of assurances were given with huge sound but there is no light at all. There is no roadmap at all as to how the Government is going to fulfil the assurances made in the Budget. This Budget wants to rely upon two components-FDI and FBI. Huge concession has been given to the FBI. The target of 5 trillion dollar sounds hollow as it has been claimed that there is going to be an inflow of 68 billion dollars which comes out to be only 2 per cent. It has been claimed that taxation on companies with a turnover of Rs.400 crore will be reduced

from 30 per cent to 25 per cent. The entire corporate world has been given substantial taxation relief without any accountability to the country. To reduce the fiscal deficit to 3.3 per cent of the GDP, the Government wants to have investment from abroad which is not good for economy. Out of 75000 crore allotted to agriculture nothing is going to be spent on the waiver of loan, promotion of agriculture research, setting up of godowns and cold-storage, rural connectivity or even for Minimum Support Price. This Government came to power not because of its performance but because of hefty promises to the people none of which has been fulfilled.

**\*SHRIMATI REKHA VERMA:**

**\*SHRI K. SUBBARAYAN:**

**SHRI SISIR KUMAR ADHIKARI:** A dream projection of making India a \$5 trillion economy by 2024-2025 is shown by the Government. Now, no Minister or Government document is talking about achieving a double-digit growth. Real GDP growth was merely 4.5 per cent during the last five years. Lack of employment is the biggest concern of the country. There is no acknowledgement of the fact of highest unemployment in the last 45 years in the Budget speech. Even if we accept the figures mentioned in the Budget speech, only 1,25,000

---

\* Please see supplement.

employment may be generated in a best case scenario. In a country of a population 130 crore it is a small figure. Under this Government, all institutions have been attacked. Economic Survey shows that the revenue receipts as a percentage of GDP is 8.2 per cent. In the Union Budget, the total revenue receipts for Budget Estimates 2019-20 as a percentage of GDP have been shown as 9.3 per cent. What magic has been done in one day that the revenue receipts of the Government increased by 1.1 per cent of the GDP? I demand a thorough probe into the fudging of numbers in the Union Budget. I oppose the move of disinvestment of forty-four PSUs. The prices of petroleum products have been raised. This move should be withdrawn. Kaju import has now gone up from 40 per cent to 70 per cent because of which, at least, one crore kaju workers will be unemployed.

**\*SHRI NALIN KUMAR KATEEL:**

**COL. RAJYAVARDHAN RATHORE:** This Budget is an essence of all the schemes of the Government. It lays a strong foundation for development. Aspirations of the people are reflected in this Budget. The Government has a target of making our economy a \$5 trillion economy by the year 2024. The Government has accorded priority to the basic necessities like roads, drinking, water, electricity and health. Presently, ours is the fastest growing economy in the world. We have had an FDI of \$64 billion in 2018-19 which is the highest till

---

\* Please see supplement.

now. The Government has allowed FDI in several new sectors. We have to spend a lot of money on import of petroleum. To deal with this challenge, we are promoting battery driven vehicles. An expenditure of Rs. 100 lakh crore on infrastructure gives a new hope because infrastructure ensures development. The Government has already constructed 1.5 lakh kms of roads in rural areas and we have set the target of 1.25 lakh kms of roads for the next five years. We have achieved our target in housing sector during the last five years and set a new target of constructing 2 crore houses now. We have started subsidy on interest in order to support MSMEs. We have promoted Start Ups and waived off the customs duty to promote Make in India. We want to set up 10,000 farmer producers organizations in rural India.

**\*SHRI ANTO ANTONY:**

**SHRI MARGANI BHARAT:** I welcome the aspirations and vision of our hon. Prime Minister to restructure and develop the concept of New India. We are confident enough that our country will achieve five trillion dollar economy. The people of Andhra Pradesh anxiously waited for a favourable announcement from the hon. Finance Minister, but we are left in deep despair. The Prime Minister in his election campaign made a promise that when the NDA Government will come to power, the bifurcated Andhra Pradesh will be given Special Category Status.

---

\* Please see supplement.

The people of Andhra Pradesh are waiting for the promises to be fulfilled. I welcome the decision to reduce corporate tax of the companies with a turnover of Rs.400 crore by 25 per cent. I would like to know whether you have any roadmap for the 2020 Tokyo Olympics? The prices of petroleum products have been increased. This will be a great deficit to aam aadmi. Why do you not bring petroleum products under GST? In Andhra Pradesh we do not even have enough funds to pay salaries to employees. We are in a huge crisis. Therefore, I urge upon the hon. Prime Minister to take care of the State of Andhra Pradesh. I would like to request the hon. Prime Minister to sanction special category status to the State of Andhra Pradesh without any further delay.

**\*SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY:**

**\*SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE:**

**SHRI RAM MOHAN NAIDU KINJARAPU:** The President's Address gives the vision of the Central Government. Then the Economic Survey comes in which depicts the strategy on how to go about the vision. Then comes the Budget. The Budget gives out the numbers, the allocations on strengthening the path that the Government wants to take on achieving its strategy and its vision. But it is missing this time. What is very disappointing is that, in the Budget speech, there are no numbers at all. It was just words in it. It was just like an extension of the

---

\* Please see supplement.



President's Address itself. There have been talks about five trillion dollars economy. This is not the solution especially for the ground level problems that we are facing today. One of the problems today is unemployment. Andhra Pradesh have been fighting for its rights for the last five years. One of them is the special status for Andhra Pradesh. Then we have other issues like Railway Zone, funds for building our new capital, Amaravati and allocation of funds for Pollavaram and backward districts. The Government does not have any right to speak about cooperative federalism. They are doing cooperative favouritism. This is totally cooperative favouritism that is being done to only BJP-ruled States. 'Make-in-India' is a fail. 'Mudra Yojana' is also a fail. About 53 per cent of Mudra loans are NPAs today. The Government have to display to the country how many companies have come through 'Make-in-India. Until a special report is released under 'Make-in-India', I cannot say it is a hit, it is a failure.

**\*SHRI KAPIL MORESHWAR PATIL:**

**SHRI FEROZE VARUN GANDHI:** Seventy-two countries, all over the world, are indulging in participatory budgeting today. My question is, can the Government initiate a new kind of budgetary process. It would make the Budget more representative and accountable. Wage inequality is a serious obstacle towards social and inclusive growth. 30 per cent of workers are not really protected by the

---

\* Please see supplement.

law in any manner. It is a fact that there is no provision in the Minimum Wage Act, 1948 to cover all workers. There is a significant variation between the minimum wage rates. In Kerala, it is Rs.905 and in Nagaland, it is Rs.16. How the Government will standardize this? I congratulate the Government on the success of UJALA Yojana, which has entailed distribution of 35 crore LEDs. But I would like to add that can we replicate the same model for solar stores and battery chargers? I read reports that over 20 per cent of farmers, particularly in areas like Bundelkhand etc. are not aware of MSP etc. I would like to ask the Government whether we can do something about that. There is a lot of talk about organic farming. Firstly, the decreased capacity of farm produce for organic farming has to be dealt with, otherwise nobody is going to do it. Similarly, for the rural population to escape money lending, we need penetration of formal credit through rural finance corporations.

**SHRI DILESHWAR KAMAIT:** It is a balanced Budget in the larger interest of every section of society and is likely to play a vital role in nation building. Alongside, this will go a long way in providing much awaited permanent solution to the incidents of flood and other calamities facing Bihar. This Budget is designed to strengthen Indian economy. The announcement made in the Union Budget is going to hugely benefit the State of Bihar. A provision for a loan of Rs. one lakh to the women associated with Self-Help Groups has been made in the

Budget. Allocation of funds to MNREGA has been enhanced. Bihar has for long been looking forward to the status of special category State. It would be in the larger interest to execute and accomplish long-pending railway projects in the Supaul Parliamentary Constituency. Apart from that, measures should be taken so that Bihar may get rid of flood and other calamities.

**SHRI B.B. PATIL:** Providing Rs.70,000 crore to the Bank capitalization is a welcome step. What is needed is more effective implementation of Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code (IBC) provisions. The schemes like the Pradhan Mantri Kaushal Vikas Yojana, Stand-Up India scheme, giving up of LPG subsidy and pension schemes are positive steps taken by this Government. As far as rural economy is concerned, formation of 10,000 new farmer producer organizations is a welcome move. What is most needed on the marketing side is a more effective implementation of MSP system. Similarly, expansion of Swachh Bharat Mission to undertake sustainable solid waste management in every village is welcome but there seems to be not sufficient Budget outlays for this. Again, the Pradhan Mantri Matsya Sampada Yojana to address the critical gaps in value chain is welcome. I would also like to request the Government of India to grant Kaleshwaram Project a national status and also release additional funds. I also urge to seek an assistance of Rs.50 crore to each of the backward districts as promised under the Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act. The proposed Budgetary allocation for National

Social Assistance Programme be increased to atleast Rs. one thousand crore. We urge the Government of India to encourage States like Telangana so that the nation can progress in the true spirit of cooperative federalism.

\*\*

\*\*

\*\*

\*\*

**SNEHLATA SHRIVASTAVA**  
*Secretary General*

---

\*\*Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

© 2019 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debate of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

*English and Hindi versions of Synopses of Lok Sabha Debates are also available at*

*<http://loksabha.nic.in>.*