

LOK SABHA

SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES (Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Thursday, February 7, 2019 / Magha 18, 1940 (Saka)

OBITUARY REFERENCE

HON'BLE SPEAKER: Hon. Members, I have to inform the House about the sad demise of our former colleague Shri Jeetendra Singh Bundela. Shri Jeetendra Singh Bundela was a Member of the 15th Lok Sabha representing the Khajuraho Parliamentary Constituency of Madhya Pradesh. Earlier, Shri Bundela was a Member of Madhya Pradesh Legislative Assembly from 2003 to 2008. He was also a member of the Committee on Human Resource Development. He had keen interest in social work.

Shri Jeetendra Singh Bundela passed away on 3 February, 2019 in New Delhi at the age of 60.

We deeply mourn the loss of our former colleague. I am sure the House would join me in conveying our condolences to the bereaved family.

The Members then stood in silence for a short while.

***MATTERS UNDER RULE 377**

1. **SHRI ABHIJIT MUKHERJEE** laid a statement regarding additional attempts to UPSC Civil Services aspirants.
2. **SHRI K. ASHOK KUMAR** laid a statement regarding guidelines for Post-Matric Scholarship for Scheduled Caste students.
3. **DR. K. GOPAL** laid a statement regarding welfare measures for fishermen community of Tamil Nadu.
4. **SHRI BALBHADRA MAJHI** laid a statement regarding need to improve BSNL/MTNL mobile/internet services in Nabarangpur Parliamentary Constituency in Odisha and Delhi.
5. **SHRI RAHUL SHEWALE** laid a statement regarding need to waive the loan taken by fishermen of Maharashtra.
6. **SHRI N.K. PREMACHANDRAN** laid a statement regarding need to develop Kollam Bypass as a four lane road.

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS – *CONTD.*

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: I thank the Hon. President for addressing hon. Members of both the Houses. But in his Address he has repeated the same things which have been narrated by our Prime Minister during the last five years. An effort has been made in the Address of Hon. President to compare

* Laid on the Table as directed by the Speaker.

the achievements of this Government with that of the previous Governments. It would have been better to mention the ideas of this Government only. The Constitution of India has given equal rights to every citizen but this Government has weakened every Constitutional institution. Reservation for *dalits* and backward classes is also being abolished. Our Prime Minister always asks as to what we have done during the last 60 years? I would like to tell him that during the last 60 years, we have enhanced literacy rate, life expectancy, irrigated lands, production of foodgrains, production of milk, road construction, construction of rail lines, establishment of colleges and so many things and we have also reduced the infant mortality rate. Besides, we have also developed so many projects under the Five Year Plans. This Government has abolished the Planning Commission. NITI Ayog has become a superficial institution. We have established several public sector undertakings to create jobs and also launched satellite like Aryabhata. In the year 1974, India had conducted a peaceful atomic test. Congress Party has enhanced the GDP of this country almost 33 times during the last 60 years. It was claimed that demonetization would eradicate corruption but poor people suffered a lot due to demonetization. Farmers too have suffered a lot due to demonetization. During the year 2011-12, the rate of unemployment was 3.8 per cent whereas as per the survey of NSSO, this rate has been increased to 6.1 per cent during the year 2017-18. According to the data of NSSO, the unemployment rate of rural youth was 5 per cent in the year 2011-12 which has increased to 17.4 per cent in the year

2017-18. The rate of unemployment among rural women was 4.8 per cent which has increased to 13.6 per cent. Unemployment has increased in almost every sector. Trade has been badly affected due to frequent changes in the GST rates. We have raised the issue of Rafael deal in this House several times but we have got no reply. I would like to request the Government to constitute a Joint Parliamentary Committee in this regard. Growth rate in agriculture sector has come down. When this Government can waive the loan of Rs. one lakh ten thousand crore to benefit corporate sector then why do they not waive the farmers' loan? There is a huge scam in Pradhan Mantri Fasal Bima Yojana. We had electrified 6,32,000 villages during the last 60 years. The law and order situation in the country has deteriorated. The prices of petrol and diesel kept falling in the international market but the Government did not reduce the price. This Government has failed to bring the Women Reservation Bill and also reduced the allocation for MNREGA upto 14 per cent. Hon. President in his Address did not utter even a single word about 'Beti Bachao, Beti Padhao'. The Government has put the Lokpal Bill in cold storage. This Government has only altered the names of old schemes. This Government claims to have launched new schemes but after little scrutiny we find that all schemes are old ones and they have changed the names only. When Baba Saheb Ambedkar handed over the Constitution to the nation, he had said that no man can be grateful at the cost of his honour and no

nation can be grateful at the cost of its liberty. Hero worship is a sure road to degradation and to eventual dictatorship.

***PROF. RICHARD HAY:**

***DR. RATNA DE (NAG):**

***SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY:**

***SHRI KRISHAN PRATAP :**

***ADV. NARENDRA KESHAV SAWAIKAR:**

***SHRI VISHNU DAYAL RAM:**

***SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA:**

***SHRI A.T. NANA PATIL:**

***SHRI BIDYUT BARAN MAHATO:**

***DR. YASHWANT SINGH:**

***DR. K. GOPAL:**

***DR. THOKCHOM MEINYA:**

***SHRIMATI R. VANAROJA:**

***SHRI THANGSO BAITE:**

***SHRI RAMESH BIDHURI:**

***ADV. JOICE GEORGE:**

***SHRIMATI DARSHANA VIKRAM JARDOSH:**

***DR. RAMESH POKHRIYAL NISHANK:**

***DR. KIRIT SOMAIYA:**

***SHRI RAJESHBHAI CHUDASAMA:**

* Please see Supplement

***SHRI P. R. SUNDARAM:**

SHRI ANANDRAO ADSUL: Hon'ble President has made a mention of all the schemes of the Government launched during its entire tenure. Swachh Bharat Abhiyan is a good scheme. Only 40 per cent toilets were constructed till 2014 and during the tenure of this Government a 98 per cent increase has been achieved. But at the same time it needs to be ensured that toilets are utilised for the purpose they have been constructed. We need to make arrangement for water in the toilets. I feel that Ayushman Bharat is the best health scheme of the world provided it is implemented properly. This will solve the big problem of our poor families. Pradhan Mantri Suraksha Bima Yojana and Pradhan Mantri Jeewan Jyoti Bima Yojana are other good schemes. But hon. President also mentioned in his Address that demonetisation was a defining moment in the Government's war on corruption and black money. I have serious objection to it. In fact, this impacted our economy in a negative manner. Our Road Transport and Highways Minister is doing good road development work. Everyone appreciates him. River connectivity is also the similar proposition. With river connectivity all our fields will get irrigation water and drinking water will also be available. We can check the losses caused by heavy rains as well as by famine. This will also check the suicides committed by our farmers.

***SHRI DHANANJAY MAHADIK:**

* Please see supplement

***SHRI ALOK SANJAR:**

SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI: Under the provisions of the Article 87 of the Constitution the point of discussion remains the government but the matters are delineated by the hon. President, hence my constructive, truthful and critical speech will be directed not towards President's Address but towards the government. On the lines of the British rulers, the government is threatening us to toe its line or face the music. This is what has recently happened to West Bengal. Today the rate of unemployment is 6.1 per cent, which is much more than four decades of unemployment put together. According to CMIE survey, 3.5 million jobs were lost due to demonetization. There is huge resentment among the people. Four things namely demonetization, unemployment, agriculture crisis and ruining the economy of this country altogether will throw them out of power in the ensuing elections. If they want to learn how to run the government and how to implement schemes properly, they should go through the schemes being implemented by the West Bengal Government. The way legislative process is being undertaken by the Government has totally undermined our Parliamentary system. The hon. President has mentioned about the concept of New India. The present regime's concept of New India is about destroying democracy, democratic institutions, destroying Constitution of India, sabotaging the new generation, creating fear and about finishing federal structure. Further unemployment, agriculture crisis, destroying

* Please see supplement

RBI and CBI, bulldozing Bills in the Parliament without discussion, fake data and pseudo patriotism speak volumes of its New India.

* **SHRI P. NAGARAJAN:**

* **SHRI GAJANAN KIRTIKAR:**

* **SHRI BADRUDDIN AJMAL:**

THE MINISTER OF FOOD PROCESSING INDUSTRIES(SHRIMATI HARSIMRAT KAUR BADAL): Undoubtedly the aspirations of the people keep on increasing and changing without any limit and it is the duty of the Governments to deliver on their aspirations. The poor are remembered only during elections and thereafter they are put into oblivion. No other than our Prime Minister has come forward and thought to address the requirements of the poor such as electric connections to the poor households, constructions of their houses and toilets, road connectivity, availability of water, scholarships for their children and took measures to take care of their prestige and healthcare needs and insurance cover for them. Today, India is being considered the one 'bright spot' in the gloomy global economy. They cannot deny the fact that India is the fastest growing economy in the world. In the Ease of Doing Business Index, we have reached 77th position in the world. We have left behind big economies like US, the UK and China and India is moving at faster rate than they are. We have the highest investment under Foreign Direct Investment in our country because the world is perceiving India as a

* Please see supplement

New India. Today, in every way India is growing in a stable and in a positive manner which they could not achieve in ten years of their rule because they were too busy with plundering the nation. This is the difference between this Government and the earlier Government. I would also like to mention here that all the development in our country has taken place and all kind of welfare schemes have been made despite the fact that we have given devolution of Central Taxes to the States. In these five years, the Government has got 23 crore bank accounts opened under the Jan Dhan Yojana. But isn't it shameful that even after 70 years crores, of poor did not have bank account in the country? This was the reason that one of their erstwhile Prime Ministers used to say that a beneficiary gets only 10 paise out of the 10 rupees sent from Delhi. But they did not take any action to stop it in the 70 years. This Government has checked scams of thousands of crores of rupees by opening bank account for everyone. Congress is misguiding the whole country about loan waiver. It had promised to waive the loans within 10 days if they would form Government in Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Chhattisgarh. Seven hundred farmers have committed suicide so far but not a single farmer has been provided any compensation though they had promised loan waivers worth 90000 crore rupees. Today teachers are on strike, Government employees are on strike, youth are also on strike. I thank the Government for putting behind bars people guilty of massacre of thousands of sikhs. Today, a chowkidar is the Prime Minister but I would like to tell the Congress Party that he is the chowkidar of the

country's resources, the country's wealth and health and the chowkidar of the country's pride, prestige and sovereignty.

***SHRI R. DHRUVANARAYANA:**

SHRI JAYADEV GALLA: I name this Budget the Band-Aid Budget for which this regime has no accountability to deliver on. The TDP walked out of the NDA and the Government following being totally ignored in the Budget 2018-19. Hon. Prime Minister had promised that if NDA comes to power, Andhra Pradesh would be given a Special Category Status for ten years, but the people of Andhra Pradesh have been betrayed. The fight for the rights of Andhra Pradesh has grown into a fight to 'Save Democracy'. I demand that the Government of India should immediately release a 'White Paper' on what it has done with regard to the implementation of Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act and assurances given by then Prime Minister, Shri Manmohan Singh ji, in the Rajya Sabha. Instead of waiving off loans of the farmers, the Government in the Budget announced that it would give Rs.17 a day. How does Rs.6000 a year help a farmer who is in a debt trap and contemplating suicide? Farmers' income in Andhra Pradesh has doubled in the last four years. The agriculture growth rate is 11 per cent against the national average of just two per cent. The PM boasted that he would create two crore jobs a year but as many as five lakh Government jobs are lying vacant in various departments. According to NSSO's latest job survey, unemployment rate is

* Please see supplement

at 40 year high at 6.1 per cent. Now, NITI Aayog is trying to push this Report under the carpet because of upcoming elections and to cover up the failure of the Government. This Regime is openly embarking on a path of cultural nationalism and wishes to define a single national identity and culture for India. They are trying to give a very narrow definition of what it means to be an Indian. This Government has passed an Order authorising 10 Central Government Agencies to monitor, intercept, and decrypt any information generated, transmitted, received, or stored in any computer source without any approval from any authority of the Government of India. Earlier, the approval of the Joint Secretary was to be taken for any interception or tapping. But it has been done without proper discussion or consensus. The above Order is a clear violation of Privacy. This Government actions over the last five years, be it relating to AP's rights, demonetization, improper implementation of GST, is proving to be a destroyer of Democracy.

***SHRI LAKHAN LAL SAHU:**

***SHRIMATI APARUPA PODDAR:**

***SHRI MD. BADARUDDOZA KHAN:**

***SHRI HARISHCHANDRA CHAVAN:**

***SHRI MANSHUKHBHAI DHANJIBHAI VASAVA:**

***SHRI S.P. MUDDAHANUME GOWDA:**

***SHRI RABINDRA KUMAR JENA:**

* Please see Supplement.

SHRI MOHAMMAD SALIM: Today Indian economy is in very poor state. In this country, 50 per cent of the wealth is concentrated with nine corporate houses. Nowadays, inequality is also rising in the society. Farmers are also not getting remunerative prices. Unemployment rate is also on the rise. Survey pertaining to labour data of 2016-17 has not been submitted. Government is still collecting the required data. Earlier it was used to be compiled within a year. This shows that this government is scared of data. Beneficiaries of PMCM are being sent letters. More than 435 crore rupees have been spent on letters sent across the country. One fourth amount is being spent on such letters. 56 per cent of the fund of *Beti Bachao Beti Padho* scheme have been spent on advertisement only. Never before in the last 4.5 decades, this country has witnessed such a high rate of unemployment. Students are fighting for their stipend. Initially Government increased the fee and then it is making promise to provide scholarships. Sardha and Narda cases which are under consideration of the Supreme Court are not under the jurisdiction of federal government. This Government did not hold any meeting of Ethics Committee pertaining to Narda scam. I would like to ask that how this government is going to curb corruption. The Government has also not constituted JPC on Rafale issue.

**THE MINISTER OF STATISTICS AND PROGRAMME
IMPLEMENTATION AND MINISTER OF CHEMICALS AND
FERTILIZERS(SHRI D.V. SADANANDA GOWDA):**

Practically, the Government thought that we should come out with Periodic Labour Force Survey as far as urban area is concerned on quarterly basis and for rural area on yearly basis. We started right from July 2017 up to December 2018. We have to collect the data quarterly and we have to come out with the report. For the last two quarters i.e. July 2018 to December 2018 and from October 2018 to December 2018, we are collecting the data and we are processing it. We have not come out with any report. That is a fake report. So, depending upon the fake report and arguing on the Floor of the House is not fair. Ultimately, the collection of data and bringing out the report is the responsibility of the Government. We are not hiding anything. We are collecting the data. The process is going on.

DR. KIRIT P. SOLANKI: In my opinion 2014 elections were historical because it has changed the condition and direction of the country. Due to the widespread corruption committed by the earlier UPA-I and UPA-II Governments, people had lost their faith on the whole political system. But this Government has restored their faith on the political system of this country. This Government has taken various steps for the welfare of the poors, farmers, women, youths and downtrodden people. The Government has also provided more than six crore LPG

connections. Similarly, one crore 30 lakh houses have been built under Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana. Moreover, approximately two crore 47 lakh free electricity connections have been provided under Pradhan Mantri Saubhagya Yojana. Similarly, Ayushman Bharat is one of the largest healthcare delivery scheme in the world under which approximately 10 crore household families would be provided five lakh rupees per annum for healthcare. The Government has also strengthen the SC/ST Act. Similarly, it has also provided 10 per cent reservation for the people belonging to general category.

SHRI JAI PRAKASH NARAYAN YADAV: This is the last session of this Government and I am sure that this Government is not going to come back. The Government should also restore 200 point roaster system. 13 point roaster system is against the welfare of SC/ST and OBCs. I would also like to demand that caste census should be conducted. Rights of SCs/STs and OBCs should be safeguarded. This Government has promoted intolerance. It has also not provided adequate employment opportunities to the youth of this country.

SHRI PREM SINGH CHANDUMAJRA: It is a matter of great pleasure for me that during the last four and half years, federal structure has been strengthened. Shares of States have been increased from 32 per cent to 42 per cent. First time in the history of our country, hon. President has addressed peasants of this country as *Anna Data*. The Government has brought many schemes to double

the income of farmers. Similarly six crore people have been provided gas connections. 98 per cent people having provided with toilet facilities. Providing houses to one crore 30 lakh people is also a commendable step. Moreover, it is a matter of immense pleasure for me that hon. President has mentioned about the road to be built connecting Kartarpur. This will facilitate the shrine visit and also improve the bilateral relations between the two countries. During the last four and half years not only we have been celebrating *Prakash Utsav* of Gurunanak Dev ji but we have also brought policies based on his sermons for the welfare of poor people of the country. This Government have also issued a commemorative coin in the honor of Guru Gobind Singh Sahab. I would like to request that Bharat Ratna should be conferred to Shahid Bhagat Singh ji and Shahid Udham Singh ji.

SHRI VIRENDER KASHYAP: In his Address, the Hon. President has presented a detailed account of the working of the Government over the last four years. Whichever schemes have been launched by the existing Government, each of them is meant for ameliorating the status of the poor. As many as ten crore families have been provided with health insurance cover under the Ayushman Bharat scheme. Barely 3-4 months have elapsed since this scheme was launched and within such a brief duration of time the number of beneficiaries has gone up to 11 lakh. Under Pradhan Mantri MUDRA Yojana, entailing investment of

approximately Rs.7 lakh crore there has been avalanche of employment opportunities for lakhs of youth.

***SHRI B. VINOD KUMAR:**

SHRI N.K. PREMACHANDRAN: The President's Address begins with the vision of three eminent stalwarts of Indian history, that is Mahatma Gandhi, Dr. B.R. Ambedkar and Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia. I would like to know from the Government as to what it has done during the last five years to realise the dreams and visions of these eminent leaders. According to me these five years were a loss to this country. I am confining my speech to two points. The first one is unemployment and the second one is NITI Aayog. The unemployment rate today is the highest during the last four and half decades. In the case of demonetisation the Government has failed. In the case of implementation of the GST also the Government has totally failed. One question I would like to pose regarding the NITI Aayog that you while they have constituted the NITI Aayog, what is its contribution?

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: The Prime Minister's dream was to build a corruption free India and to eradicate poverty and bridge the gap between the poor and the rich. Our Prime Minister talks of cashless society. But unless we bring in radical changes in the existing system, how can we achieve our aspiration? I have never spoken a word either inside the House or outside the House to denigrate the

* Please see Supplement.

office of the Prime Minister. The only thing that hurts me is that when it is said that the coalition Governments have not done anything. In 1996 the coalition Government headed by me took a decision to reduce the fertiliser price by Rs.1000 per tonne. I went to Northeastern States, I gave a special grant of Rs. 6100 crore for the works which still have not been completed. I went to Kashmir five times and took decisions to create confidence among the people of Jammu and Kashmir. I took the decision to set up Delhi Metro. Under the Public Distribution System, 36 crore people below poverty line got 10kg rice at Rs.3, 5kg wheat at Rs.2. We introduced Voluntary Disclosure Scheme to bring black money back. Coalition Governments can also do something if proper understanding is there. Whichever coalition Governments were there in the past, they have also done something for the States. Pension for farmers and poor people, eradication of poverty and all those things have not been a matter of concern of the present Government only. The Government has announced Rs.6000 per annum for farmers. That is only Rs.17 per day. Telengana is giving Rs.10,000. Odisha is providing more than Rs.10,000. The Prime Minister announced Rs.6000, out of which Rs.2000 is in this Financial year. I only request the hon. Prime Minister that at least in this session he should declare a minimum of Rs.15000 for farmers.

**

**

**

**

SNEHLATA SHRIVASTAVA
Secretary General

**Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

© 2019 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debates of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopsis of Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>.