

LOK SABHA

SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES (Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Tuesday, February 5, 2019 / Magha 16, 1940 (Saka)

OBSERVATION BY THE SPEAKER

Re: Maintaining proper decorum and exercising restraint by Members in the House.

HON'BLE SPEAKER: My only submission is that hearing of the case is going on in the Supreme Court of India and the CBI is discharging its duty. Let the Parliament function. Every institution has its own responsibilities. I request all the Members to go to their seats.

*MATTERS UNDER RULE 377

1. **DR. KIRIT SOMAIYA** laid a statement regarding delay in issuance of No Objection Certificate by Navy for redevelopment of properties in Ghatkopar & Kanjur in Mumbai.
2. **SHRI AJAY MISRA TENI** laid a statement regarding providing economic and social security to railway coolies.

* Laid on the Table as directed by the Speaker.

3. **SHRI KIRTI AZAD** laid a statement regarding establishment of AIIMS in Darbhanga, Bihar.
4. **SHRI RATTAN LAL KATARIA** laid a statement regarding need to provide funds for construction of Yamunanagar-Chandigarh railway line & upgradation of Ambala Railway Station.
5. **SHRI NIHAL CHAND** laid a statement regarding need to care and protect cows.
6. **SHRIMATI RAMA DEVI** laid a statement regarding construction of bridge on Bagmati & Lalbakaya rivers in Bihar.
7. **SHRI MANSHUKHBHAI DHANJIBHAI VASAVA** laid a statement regarding need to provide modern medical equipment & ensure presence of doctors in hospitals in Bharuch Parliamentary Constituency, Gujarat.
8. **SHRI HARISHCHANDRA CHAVAN** laid a statement regarding need to promote export of onion and undertake research work to improve the quality of onion.
9. **SHRI RAM TAHAL CHAUDHARY** laid a statement regarding need to regularize the services of MGNREGA workers and provide them equal pay for equal work in Jharkhand.
10. **SHRI RAMCHARAN BOHRA** laid a statement regarding recognition of electropathy as a system of medicine.

11. **SHRI JANARDAN SINGH SIGRIWAL** laid a statement regarding need to provide immediate treatment to patients on the recommendation of Members of Parliament in AIIMS, New Delhi.
12. **SHRI RAMESHWAR TELI** laid a statement regarding need to introduce AC train between Tinsukia and Bikaner.
13. **SHRI S.P. MUDDAHANUME GOWDA** laid a statement regarding new railway projects in Tumkur Parliamentary Constituency of Karnataka.
14. **SHRI R. DHRUVANARAYANA** laid a statement regarding effective implementation of laws to curb child marriage.
15. **SHRI R. P. MARUTHARAJAA** laid a statement regarding need to set up an integrated Veterinary Park in Perambalur Parliamentary Constituency of Tamil Nadu.
16. **SHRI G. HARI** laid a statement regarding various railway related issues in Arakkonam Parliamentary Constituency of Tamil Nadu.
17. **SHRIMATI APARUPA PODDAR** laid a statement regarding construction of a new Sub Post Office building in Khanakul in Arambag Parliamentary Constituency of West Bengal.
18. **DR. MAMTAZ SANGHAMITA** laid a statement regarding problems of railway coolies.

19. **DR. KULMANI SAMAL** laid a statement regarding basic amenities in all the railway stations between Cuttack and Paradip in Odisha.
20. **SHRI RAM MOHAN NAIDU KINJARAPU** laid a statement regarding need for a separate Railway Zone in Andhra Pradesh.
21. **SHRI TEJ PRATAP SINGH YADAV** laid a statement regarding need to restore old pension scheme.
22. **SHRI PREM SINGH CHANDUMAJRA** laid a statement regarding infrastructure for import and export of goods in Punjab.
23. **SHRI RADHESHYAM BISWAS** laid a statement regarding need to revive two units of Hindustan Paper Corporation in Assam.
24. **ADV. JOICE GEORGE** laid a statement regarding need to revise Standard Input Output Norms (SION) for import of natural rubber.

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS

SHRI HUKMDEO NARAYAN YADAV *moving the Motion said:* At the very beginning of his Address, Hon. President said that the Government aims to realize the dreams of Gandhi, Ambedkar and Lohia". Gandhiji had envisioned to have maximum budgetary provision for the most vulnerable section of society. Ambedkar ji had also envisioned a social revolution empowering the poorest, the helpless and the weakest sections of society giving them the right to live with

dignity in the society. Dr. Lohia had advocated equality bridging the gap between rich and poor. The schemes being implemented by the Government are aimed at bringing financial equality. For example 'Pradhan Mantri Jan Dhan Yojana' has been launched to uplift the poor. As on today, as many as 34 crore Jan Dhan accounts have been opened in which nearly Rs.84-85 thousand crore has been deposited by the poor people living in villages. Every household is being equipped with toilets. Houses are being built for our poor and destitute brethren under Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana. Irrigation facility is being made available under Pradhan Mantri Sinchayi Yojana. In the Union Budget, the Government has announced that Rs.6,000 shall be directly transferred into the bank accounts of the farmers with land holding upto 5 acres. Since funds are being directly transferred into the accounts of the beneficiaries, the role of intermediaries has become a thing of the past. As a result, they are forming a front against the Prime Minister. Coming to the healthcare facilities, thanks to *Ayushman Bharat* scheme which ensures the treatment of the poor entailing medical expenditure upto Rs.5 lakh and nearly 10 lakh people have already been benefited. All such schemes do not go down well with those characterized with elite mindset. Three lakh shell companies have been found to be allegedly involved in money laundering. As many as 22,000 C.As. involved in such acts have been apprehended. Now, the highest Civilian Award viz. Bharat Ratna has been conferred on the most suitable persons.

The Prime Minister envisages to recognize the talent and bring it out of shadow. I would like to call upon poor, backward and dalits of India to desist themselves from following the leaders belonging to their caste blindly and move forward in an inclusive spirit. The upper castes have also been extended 10 per cent reservation in a bid to bring in harmony in society. Going by Dr. Lohia's words, the day on which the poor born in upper caste communities affiliate themselves to the backward, dalit communities and the deprived ones dissociating from the elite, there would be emergence of a real India.

SHRI JAGDAMBIKA PAL *seconding the Motion, said:* Today, we are not only holding a discussion on the President's Address but are going to discuss the achievements of our Government during the last four and a half years. In a way, it is a report card of the work done by the Government during the last four and a half years. In the year 2014, the entire nation was engulfed in corruption which led to massive mandate in our favour. Under the Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi, 12 crore farmers will get Rs.6000 every year with an outflow of Rs.75000 crore from the exchequer. Our Government is providing free electricity connections under the *Saubhagya* scheme. Free stoves, cylinders and regulators are being given under the *Ujjwala* Yojana. Whereas corruption was the buzz word in 2014, today in 2019 everybody is discussing the schemes like Ayushman Bharat, Saubhagya, Ujjwala, Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi and Pradhan Mantri

MUDRA Yojana. The Government has constructed toilets for nine crore families. This Government is fulfilling the dreams of Mahatma Gandhi. For the first time in the country, the Government has taken a decision to provide 1.5 times of the cost as Minimum Support Price of 22 crops. The Government has paid Rs.23 thousand crore against the dues of sugarcane farmers. This is the first Government to waive Rs.36 thousand crore farm loan benefitting 68 lakh farmers. We have issued 17 crore Soil Health Cards. Our Government has started Neem coating of urea. Now, there is no shortage of fertilizers in the country. A total of 71 irrigation projects have been completed. We had irrigation capacity of 28.9 lakh hectares after Independence till 2014 whereas we have increased it to 35.6 lakh hectares during the last 4.5 years. We have provided crop insurance at low premium under the Pradhan Mantri Fasal Bima Yojana. Earlier, the farmers did not get any compensation if the damage was less than 50 per cent. But now, the Government is providing compensation even if the damage to crops is only 35 per cent. The Government has increased the Minimum Support Price and procurement has increased 13 times. Ten crore families in the country will benefit from the *Ayushman Bharat* scheme but the Government of West Bengal is not implementing this scheme. We have completed 100 days of *Ayushman Bharat* scheme and ten lakh people have got the benefit of a total of Rs.3000 crore. This is an honour to the country that our Prime Minister inaugurated the World Economic Forum at

Davos for the first time. India stood 142nd in the world ranking in 'Ease of Doing Business' in the year 2014 but in the last 4.5 years we have scaled up to the 77th rank. Without curtailing the reservation quota of any category, this Government has provided 10 per cent reservation to the economically weaker people of general category. This Government has provided financial assistance to the farmers and pension to 10 crore workers in the unorganized sector. Exemption in income tax has been allowed on the income upto Rs.5 lakh. Inflation was around 10.1 per cent during the period from 2009 to 2014 which is 2.19 per cent now. About 34 crore Jan Dhan accounts have been opened in the country with a deposit of Rs.88 thousand crore. About five crore people took holy dip at the sangam in Prayagraj yesterday on the occasion of *mauni amawasya*. I congratulate the Government for sanctioning different projects of Rs.25 thousand crore under the Namami Gange project. Our Government is against corruption. That is why extradition of economic offenders is happening now. Our Government has introduced specific schemes to fulfill the promises made in the year 2014. Our Government is making a new India wherein everyone gets justice, the right to equality and security. I support this motion.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB: Farmers have been literally surviving on loans. A debate is going on whether farm loan waiver is the right answer to address farmers woes? How will the State Governments bear the fiscal burden?

Where will the money come from? Telangana launched the Rythu Bandhu Programme, it has triggered a chain reaction amongst States to announce similar or improved versions of financial aids. Odisha has launched an economic package. Instead of waiver, Odisha has announced a package of Rs.180 crore for three years. Now the Union Government has announced Rs.6000 per year to a family having up to two hectares of cultivable land. No doubt, it is a welcome step. But this direct income support cannot be a permanent solution. The actual solution lies in fixing the Minimum Support Price. I regret to mention that there is no mention of revisiting the determination of MSP. Gujarat and Maharashtra have low concentration of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe population, while UP and the eastern coastal States like Odisha have high concentration which need 90 per cent support in education and other Centrally sponsored schemes. The disease will not come and ask you whether you have a BPL card or not. That is what Ayushman Bharat always asks for. But our programme in Odisha covers all families. Odisha has its own Swasthya Kalyan Yojana. Normally, the President's Address which has actually been prepared by the Government deals with only one year-since last budget till the new budget is placed. Here, it covers the whole five years. The hon. President has reminded us about the 150th Anniversary of the birth of Mahatma Gandhi. It is also the centenary of Visva Bharati. I do not know why it did not find a mention in the Address of the hon. President. Changing a

Government from one to another will not actually help this country to a greater effect, if we do not stand what liberation is. The first is the liberation of our public like fear. Fear can paralyse dissent, immobilize free speech, free association. In the eighth decade of our Independence, India ought to be afraid of nothing, save its conscience.

DR. P. VENUGOPAL: It was but natural that the Government would only want to narrate the achievements of its entire tenure in the President's Address. I would like to thank the hon. Prime Minister for having laid the foundation stone for establishing a new AIIMS in Madurai last week. I also appreciate the efforts of ISRO and extend kudos to them. However, it is my duty as well to point out the shortcomings in his address and the issues which did not find a mention in his Address. I would like to point out that in my parliamentary constituency, we have Avadi railway station where the level crossing had been closed about more than ten years ago, but there is no subway. I would request the hon. Railway Minister once again to see that the subway is constructed early for the benefit of people of my constituency. As many as 13 coastal and non-coastal districts in Tamil Nadu had been devastated by Cyclone Gaja during November, 2018. I would request the Centre to announce that calamity as a national disaster. I would also request the Government to see that 69 per cent reservation, which is already existing in Tamil Nadu, is given constitutional status. I would like to proudly say that Tamil Nadu

has the highest enrolment ratio in higher education in the country of more than 45 per cent solely because of the scholarship provided to them. I request the Centre to immediately release its Central assistance to Tamil Nadu. In the case of GST compensation also, the Government of Tamil Nadu is yet to receive a total arrears of Rs. 1760.53 crore from the Centre. There is an unsettled IGST amount to Tamil Nadu to the tune of Rs.5454 crore. As far as central allocation to States is concerned, the Centre should not discriminate against any State and without bias, it should sanction or release more funds for performing States. India's GDP is depended mainly on 5-6 States, which contribute in a major way. That being so what are they getting in return? It is paltry and they should get their due share of central allocation. I would like to point out that the Central Water Commission had granted permission to the Cauvery Neeravari Nigam Limited, Karnataka to prepare a DPR for Mekadatu Project on Cauvery river. The Central Water Commission did not consider the genuine and justifiable objections of Tamil Nadu. I request the Centre to immediately withdraw the permission granted to Karnataka to prepare DPR for Mekadatu Project. There is a demand from our Party to confer Bharat Ratna on Dr. Annadurai and Dr. Jayalalitha-both of whom were former Chief Ministers of Tamil Nadu.

SHRI MADHUKARRAO YASHWANTRAO KUKADE: The nation is celebrating 150th golden jubilee anniversary of Mahatma Gandhi. However, a day

before, a leader of Hindu Mahasabha in Eastern Uttar Pradesh shot at the statute and the photograph of Mahatma Gandhi. We all should condemn it. Had this Government issued any statement regarding desecration of photograph of Mahatma Gandhi then everyone would have felt that Mahatma Gandhi is their ideal. In the country all the ordnance factories are being closed down which could have been the tools of building a new India. I fail to understand as to how we are talking about 'Make in India'. The Government has shut down the TV channel in the entire rural area which covered the rural areas and talked about the farmers. Popular TV channels do not talk about the rural areas. I demand that the Government TV channel should be restarted. Where will the artists of rural areas find work if this TV channel is shut down? We should make efforts to see that the Government projects are continued and provide job opportunities. TV centres are being closed everywhere and their employees have been rendered unemployed. We want that the Government should build Ram Mandir in Ayodhya. This is our feeling. The people of Vidarbha gave complete support to the BJP but a separate Vidarbha State is not being formed. The development of Vidarbha has got stuck. There was a BHEL factory. Had Vidarbha come into existence, this factory could have been revived. We had talked about reservation for women. But this Government has done nothing in this regard. Unmanned level crossings had been discontinued but the places where underground crossings should have been made remain

waterlogged and the people on both sides remain disconnected. We want progress for the farmers and good roads for them. On the behalf of my party, I oppose the President's Address.

***SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE:**

***SHRI NARANBHAI KACHHADIA:**

***SHRIMATI JAYSHREEBEN PATEL:**

***SHRI PRASANNA KUMAR PATASANI :**

***DR. KULMANI SAMAL:**

***SHRI RAMCHARAN BOHRA:**

***SHRIMATI RANJANBEN BHATT:**

***SHRIMATI RAMA DEVI:**

***SHRI TEJ PRATAP SINGH YADAV:**

***SHRI G. HARI:**

***SHRI A. ARUNMOZHITHEVAN:**

***SHRI P. KUMAR:**

* Please see Supplement.

***SHRI T. G. VENKATESH BABU:**

SHRI RATTAN LAL KATARIA: On 31st January, H.E. the President, gave an historic and unprecedented address in which he mentioned demonetisation, Rafale, GST, Surgical strike, One Rank One Pension, National Police Memorial, Ujjawala Yojana, Ayushman Yojana, Mudra Yojana. After the hard work by the hon. Prime Minister, the Indian economy is the most promising economy in the world today. About Aadhaar card, the World Bank has said that the countries of the world should follow the Indian system of Aadhaar card. The way the Government has taken steps for bringing together the benefits being provided to all the beneficiaries through Aadhaar, even the World Bank has followed the IMF in contending that poverty is being eradicated in India. Direct benefit of more than Rs.7 lakh crore has been provided to the poor through these schemes. During the UPA-I and UPA-II regime, 1 lakh 17 thousand crore rupees used to be pocketed by the power brokers through corruption. The hon. Prime Minister has saved this money of the people of this country. 'Work is Worship', H.E. President has mentioned it. Following this, an environment of development is being created in the country today by establishing more than 3 lakh common service centres, by seizing benami properties worth 50,000 crore rupees and by increasing the Income Tax base from 3.5 crore to 7 crore. Keeping in view, the picture of India presented

by H.E. the President in his Address and the growing confidence of the people in this Government, I support this motion of thanks.

SHRI DHARMENDRA YADAV: I, on behalf of my party, thank H.E. the President for his Address. The President's Address spells out the policies and programmes of the Union Government but it is sad that the Government has not shied away from using his Address to speak lies. Our hon. leader believes that the better way to ensure social justice in this country is to conduct census of all castes and reservation be provided to all castes in proportion to their population. Unfortunately, there is hardly any democratic institution which has not been undermined by this Government. The cost of gas cylinders which used to be available for Rs. 300-400 during UPA regime has been increased to more than Rs. 1000. The Swaminathan Commission recommended that the farmers should be given a minimum support price which may be one and a half time more than the cost of production. Whenever we come to discuss about the plight of the farmers, we feel sorry. Over the last five years 60 thousand farmers have committed suicide. I would like to ask the Union Government as to why sugar is being imported from Pakistan at a time when the Government is unable to make payment to the farmers of the country especially of Uttar Pradesh. I would also like to submit that a lot has been said about SCs, BCs and minorities but never have these communities been pushed on the margin in the history of the country as much as in

this Government. About 13 lakh people are affected by the New Pension Scheme. They are demanding that the Old Pension System should be restored. I would like to urge that their demand may please be accepted. Similarly, more than five lakh literacy promoters have been rendered jobless. I would like to urge that their honorarium should be increased and they should be employed again.

***SHRIMATI POONAMBEN MAADAM:**

***SHRIMATI SANTOSH AHLAWAT:**

SHRI GANESH SINGH: First of all I would like to express my gratitude to the hon. Prime Minister for conferring the award of Bharat Ratna on Nanaji Deshmukh who chose Chitrakoot of my Parliamentary Constituency, Satna as his place of work. I would like to submit that the economy of the country has acquired the growth rate of 7.3 per cent during the last four and a half years. India's contribution to the world GDP was 2.6 per cent in 2014 and the same has gone up to 3.3 per cent. The Government has formulated schemes keeping the basic requirements of every individual in view. In my Parliamentary Constituency of Satna, 1,70,000 beneficiaries have been provided gas connections under the Ujjwala scheme. 44,475 houses have been approved for construction under Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana and out of them the construction of 37,117 houses has been completed. 2,05,800 Golden Cards have been issued to the people in my

* Please see Supplement.

district under the Ayushman Bharat Yojana. 44,826 connections have already been provided in the Satna district under the Saubhagya Yojana. The Modi Government has done justice to the poor of the upper castes by providing them 10 per cent reservation. I would like to thank the Government once again by saying this much that the scenario of the rural and urban areas is changing and the poor people have started believing that they might be free from problems. The hon. Prime Minister has provided an honest Government during the last five years. The way the charges of corruption are being levelled against our Government is not conducive to the fabric of democracy.

SHRIMATI BUTTA RENUKA: The Government has been saying so many things during the last five years and their achievements are not up to the expectations. Some of the Government's actions have resulted in dismantling the credible institutions. This is a great injustice to the democracy and to the future generations. The hon. President's Speech contains references to 'Demonetisation'. Many people have lost jobs and many sectors have still not recovered from the effects of demonetisation. Similarly, I also support that the Defence forces should be equipped with the latest technology and weaponry to meet any eventuality. But transparency is required in defence purchases. So, I request this Government to appoint Joint Parliamentary Committee so that any misgivings on the Rafale deal can be cleared. Another issue of serious concern is the intolerance displayed by

the ruling Party. This approach is not forward looking and will lead to internal conflicts and unrest in the society. Similarly, I request this Government to establish and develop structures which will reduce the interface of the people with the officials which may aid in reducing the corruption. As a woman parliamentarian, I am concerned about the steps undertaken for the development of women. Construction of toilets will be a big morale booster apart from being a health initiative especially to rural woman. The Government should also quickly bring in the legislation for providing reservation to women in democratic institutions. Apart from that, Government should endeavour to do a lot for the farmers. So, I request this Government to provide minimum support price for tomatoes and onions and also to formulate a scheme for the development of storage facilities. When it comes to the handloom sector, it is time to provide substantial relief to the weaving community by designing appropriate schemes and also to bring handloom products under zero per cent GST. I would also request this Government to design a special package for Rayalaseema and implement the same in a time bound programme. I am extremely disappointed at the absence of any mention on Andhra Pradesh in the President's Address. Granting of special status will aid and boost the progress of the newly created State of Andhra Pradesh.

***SHRI SATYAPAL SINGH :**

***SHRI DILIPKUMAR MANSUKHLAL GANDHI:**

SHRI SURESH C. ANGADI: I congratulate our Government for providing services to the downtrodden and the last person of society. Our Government has provided so many schemes for the poor people of India. Then, Constitutional status was given to the OBC people by our Government. Similarly, 10 per cent reservation to the Economically Backward people was also given by our Government. Our Government has launched the Ujjwala Yojana for the poorest of the poor women of the country. In the last four years, we have given another 12 crore connections under this Ujjwala Yojana. Similarly, now even a common man can fly in an aircraft under the Scheme called UDAN. Apart from that, there are schemes like Swachh Bharat and Ayushman Bharat. Today, under the Swachh Bharat Scheme, the entire country has taken it as a movement. Apart from that, during the last four years, in my Parliamentary Constituency, I have made certain developments. Now, UDAN-III has been started in which 14 cities are going to be connected to different places from Belgaum. Apart from this, Belgaum is selected in the first phase of the Smart Cities Mission. A Passport Office also has been given to Belgaum. All these have been the developments made by the Government

* Please see Supplement.

during the last four years. I thank the Government for providing all these facilities to my Parliamentary Constituency.

SHRI C. N. JAYADEVAN: The Government has failed to fulfill all the promises it made while it took charge of the Government. The dramatic move of demonetization has been a colossal disaster of the Indian economy, resulting in closure of several lakhs of small and medium enterprises and loss of jobs to millions of workers. The latest NSSO survey, which was not allowed to make public by the Government, has revealed this fact. Earlier the Government had revised and manipulated the GDP data published by CSO to show NDA years looking better than UPA. In order to divert people's ire against the Government, the Government brought the issue of reservation in jobs and education for economically weaker sections of upper castes and Ram Mandir in Ayodhya. The 10 per cent reservation for economically weaker sections is against the Constitution. Similarly, the Triple Talaq Bill is to appease the Muslim women and terrorize the Muslim men. The entire North East is witnessing massive protest actions against the Citizenship Bill. I hope better sense will prevail upon the Government to withdraw both these Bills. Again, the working class all over the country had observed a two-day strike. Similarly, the agricultural workers in the country are demanding a comprehensive central legislation for their welfare and security.

**

**

**

**

SNEHLATA SHRIVASTAVA
Secretary General

** Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

© 2019 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debates of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopsis of Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>.