

LOK SABHA

SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES* (Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Wednesday, July 3, 2019 / Ashadha 12, 1941 (Saka)

PANEL OF CHAIRPERSONS

HON. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, I have to inform the House that under Rule 9 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I have nominated Shri N.K. Premachandran as a Member of the Panel of Chairpersons.

THE NEW DELHI INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION CENTRE BILL, 2019

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE; MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD)

moved that leave be granted to introduce a Bill to provide for the establishment and incorporation of the New Delhi International Arbitration Centre for the

* Hon. Members may kindly let us know immediately the choice of language (Hindi or English) for obtaining Synopsis of Lok Sabha Debates.

purpose of creating an independent and autonomous regime for institutionalised arbitration and for acquisition and transfer of undertakings of the International Centre for Alternative Dispute Resolution and to vest such undertakings in the New Delhi International Arbitration Centre for the better management of arbitration so as to make it a hub for institutional arbitration and to declare the New Delhi International Arbitration Centre to be an institution of national importance and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto.

DR. SHASHI THAROOR *opposing the motion for introduction of the Bill, said:* We need an autonomous arbitration centre which is independent of the Government. The Bill vests the powers of direction and control with the Central Government in relation to the arbitration centre. The Bill specifies that every rule made under it, shall be placed before Parliament. Now we have to give enough elbow room to the Centre to change its arbitration rules. The relationship between the Centre and the parties are contractual in nature. Thus, the Centre must be held accountable and should work in a transparent manner. The Bill should adopt a more acceptable standard for the question of the Centre's liability. The transparency standards also need to be increased. We do need a robust International Arbitration Centre that can make India the hub of arbitration. Therefore, the hon. Minister should withdraw this Bill and come back with a Bill that can truly meet international standards.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: On the one hand, he is supportive of the idea that India must develop as a hub of domestic and international arbitration, but on the other hand, he comes with a 'however'. This Bill has been enacted pursuant to a recommendation of a Committee headed by Justice Srikrishna consisting of many eminent Jurists. We are keen as a Government that India must emerge as a big hub of arbitration. After introduction when we debate the Bill, you will have ample opportunity to raise queries and I will have some time to respond to your queries.

The Bill was introduced.

SUBMISSION BY MEMBER

Re: Alleged derogatory remarks made by Lt. Governor of Puducherry against Tamils.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS; MINISTER OF COAL AND MINISTER OF MINES (SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI) *responding to the issue raised by an hon. Member, said:* As per the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, a Member while speaking, shall not reflect upon the conduct of persons in high authority unless the discussion is based on a substantive motion drawn in proper terms. They have not moved the motion. So, I

appeal to them - let them give notice of the Motion and the Government will consider that.

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI RAJNATH SINGH) *also responding said:* Rule 352 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha clearly says that a Member while speaking, shall not reflect upon the conduct of persons in high authority unless the discussion is based on a substantive motion drawn in proper terms. If they want to have discussion on the conduct of the Lt. Governor, let them move a substantive motion.

***MATTERS UNDER RULE 377**

- (1) **SHRI ASHOK KUMAR RAWAT** laid a statement regarding flood control measures in Misrikh Parliamentary Constituency, Uttar Pradesh.
- (2) **DR. NISHIKANT DUBEY** laid a statement regarding pending projects of Godda Parliamentary Constituency, Jharkhand.
- (3) **SHRI BHAGIRATH CHAUDHARY** laid a statement regarding need to establish a Kendriya Vidyalaya in Kekri in Ajmer Parliamentary Constituency, Rajasthan.

* Laid on the Table as directed by the Chair.

- (4) **SHRI NARENDRA KUMAR** laid a statement regarding drinking water problem in Jhunjhunu Parliamentary Constituency, Rajasthan.
- (5) **SHRI VINOD KUMAR SONKAR** laid a statement regarding need to establish a head post office in Kaushambi district, Uttar Pradesh.
- (6) **SHRI ANURAG SHARMA** laid a statement regarding need to implement AMRUT scheme in Jhansi Parliamentary Constituency, Uttar Pradesh.
- (7) **PROF. RITA BAHUGUNA JOSHI** laid a statement regarding need to construct a pucca bridge on river Ganga between Prayagraj and Bhadohi districts in Uttar Pradesh.
- (8) **SHRI BHAGWANTH KHUBA** laid a statement regarding compensation to farmers.
- (9) **SHRIMATI DIYA KUMARI** laid a statement regarding drinking water problem in Rajsamand Parliamentary Constituency, Rajasthan.
- (10) **DR. KIRIT P. SOLANKI** laid a statement regarding tribal health care in the country.
- (11) **SHRI SUDHAKAR TUKARAM SHRANGARE** laid a statement regarding need to expedite construction of Gulbarga - Latur new railway line.
- (12) **SHRI AJAY BHATT** laid a statement regarding closure of HMT factory at Ranibagh in Nainital district of Uttarakhand.

- (13) **SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY** laid a statement regarding construction of a railway line between Chhapra and Muzaffarpur, Bihar.
- (14) **SHRI BIDYUT BARAN MAHATO** laid a statement regarding need to construct an airport at Dhalbhugarh in Jamshedpur Parliamentary Constituency, Jharkhand.
- (15) **SHRI MANOJ KOTAK** laid a statement regarding shelter homes for homeless people in Mumbai.
- (16) **DR. RAM SHANKAR KATHERIA** laid a statement regarding construction of a dam under Pachnada project in Uttar Pradesh.
- (17) **SHRIMATI APARAJITA SARANGI** laid a statement regarding need to construct flyover at Hanspal on N.H. 16 in Bhubaneswar, Odisha.
- (18) **SHRI ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY** laid a statement regarding formal border trade along the Indo-Bangladesh border.
- (19) **DR. M. K. VISHNU PRASAD** laid a statement regarding construction of railway line projects from Tindivanam to Nagari and Tindivanam to Thiruvannamalai in Tamil Nadu.
- (20) **SHRI GAURAV GOGOI** laid a statement regarding road connectivity in Bilgaon and Jamuguri in Nagaon, Assam.

- (21) **SHRI A. GANESHAMURTHI** laid a statement regarding need to construct lower under subway at Kodumudi Railway Station in Tamil Nadu.
- (22) **SHRIMATI PRATIMA MONDAL** laid a statement regarding need to complete one side Railway platform of Chandkhali Halt Station in West Bengal.
- (23) **SHRI SRIDHAR KOTAGIRI** laid a statement regarding special Economic Status to Andhra Pradesh.
- (24) **SHRI KRUPAL BALAJI TUMANE** laid a statement regarding setting up of National Investment Manufacturing Zone in Nagpur, Maharashtra.
- (25) **SHRI SUNIL KUMAR PINTU** laid a statement regarding need to develop N.H. 104 between Sitamarhi and Sursand in Bihar as per laid down norms.
- (26) **SHRI K. SUBBARAYAN** laid a statement regarding need to laying underground cables instead of erecting overhead high voltage power lines by Power Grid Corporation Ltd. in Tamil Nadu.
-

THE DENTISTS (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2019

**THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE;
MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, AND MINISTER OF**

EARTH SCIENCES (DR. HARSH VARDHAN) *moving the motion for consideration of the Bill, said:* The first Dental Council of India was established under the Dentists Act, 1948. This Council had prepared the Indian Dentists Register. There were only three dental colleges in the country at that time. There was a shortage of dentists. Some people practised dentistry to earn their livelihood, though they did not have any formal degree. Such practitioners having more than five years practice were put in Part-B of the said Register. There are about 2 lakh 70 thousand doctors in Part-A of the Register whereas only 979 doctors are there in Part-B. In order to rationalize the old law, amendments in three sections of the said Act are proposed in this Bill. This Bill was introduced in this Lok Sabha in December 2018 but due to some reasons it was not taken up at that time. So, Government has brought this Bill again after getting the Cabinet approval for it. I would like to request all the hon. Members to pass it unanimously.

DR. M. K. VISHNU PRASAD *initiating said:* Government has to bring a comprehensive Bill because by passing this Bill is not going to solve the problem. The main point is that in 1948, the Dental Act envisaged the constitution of a Dentists Council of India. At that time, they also thought to have registry of dental

practitioners also. But after 1972, this registration did not take place. So, that is why it has become redundant now. Now, the question is, in the Dentists Council of India two members are taking part from Part-B. They are dental practitioners. So, I want to know from the Government as to what will happen to these posts. Are they going to be vacant or are they going to be replaced by the members belonging to Part-A? Similarly, the State Dental Council and Joint Dental Council, who can be elected among themselves, should also be represented from Part-A. Otherwise, the bureaucratic nominee will outnumber the dental practitioners. So, this is my humble submission to revise this Bill and bring back a new Bill accommodating the members from Part-A and also increase the number from two in the MCI and four in the Dental Council of India. The Government must also take strict measures to ensure transparency and formulate an anti-corruption policy to deter any instances of corruption in future. So, I humbly suggest the Government to re-create or re-frame the Dental Council of India. We have to make a mandatory step here by appointing a dentist compulsorily in all the PHCs as well as train all the ASHA workers and village health workers and teach them about the basic oral healthcare. My humble request is that this clause pertaining to availability of 10 km. radius should be taken into consideration seriously so that a lot of dental colleges can come in the rural areas also. I would be appreciating if the Government come back with a revised and comprehensive Bill which will take care of dental education profession largely. I would also request the Government

to establish a dental college with a research centre in my Arani Parliamentary Constituency.

SHRI NIHAL CHAND: This Bill will benefit the poor people living in villages the maximum as they are unable to reach the towns. Provision has been made in this Bill for the constitution of a Council and the Government is committed to nominate 7 Members in it. Today, we are facing acute shortage of dentists in rural areas. This Government is committed to bridge this shortage also. I would like to urge upon the Government that provision should be made in this Act so as to ensure that dentists are deployed in primary health centres of the villages as well. Through you, I would also like to request the Government that one post should be there for maxillofacial surgery, at least in district headquarters. I would also like to request to introduce bridge course for BDS as syllabus of MBBS and BDS are very much alike. On this occasion, I would also like to request that dentistry should be associated with the NRHM and post of dentists may be added to it. With this step, people of rural and urban areas will be benefited a lot. Apart from that, associating nature therapy in all the States will also provide benefit across the country. For the first time, transparency in medical education has been ensured through NEET by this Government only. I would congratulate the Government for realizing the importance of this Bill and presenting it in this House. I would request this august House to support this Bill.

DR. T. R. PAARIVENDHAR: This Dental Bill to be passed is very simple and clear. The idea is that we have got enough number of dentists and there is no need for unqualified people. That is the crux of the Bill. Instead of criticizing the Bill, I would like to talk about the problems being faced by the dental colleges, getting professors at the senior level and at the post-graduate level. My idea here is that the Dental Council has to be sure and careful about the selection of first four Members, and also two other Members as substitute. Similarly, the genuineness of the Members in the Council is very important. So, we have to talk about the quality of Council Members we are going to take. Government should make sure that these Members discharge their duties as per law. I would ask the hon. Minister to consider favourably the proposal of the Dental Council of India and the NITI Aayog that dentists be allowed to study a bridge course and practise modern techniques in dental care. The UG curriculum was revised in 2007 and has not been updated till date. The Government should also bring in dental insurance for all in the country. The Government should encourage rural dental practice among the dentists by giving attractive incentives to dentists to practise in the rural regions. For more transparency and to avoid corruption, the Dental Council may be abolished along with the Medical Council. The Inspectors should be selected from all parts of the country, not from one State or one particular town which is the case now.

SHRIMATI PRATIMA MONDAL: I strongly oppose this Bill on the ground that the members will be nominated by the Government. If members of the Council are nominated, the transparency will be lost. This should be amended and all the members must be elected. I would like to ask the whether the Government seeks to fix a minimum qualification for the members of the Council because in the present scenario, the members do not have any minimum requirement whereas the Council being a regulatory body needs experienced and highly qualified members. It is also important for us to provide support to this sector. Out of 310 dental colleges, only 40 are Government institutes. A major setback is the uneven distribution of colleges. Certain States like Jharkhand, North-Eastern States, etc. have very few colleges when compared to other States. The proposed amendment is a small step forward which requires a big leap. Our prime focus should be to spread awareness amongst the people, provide better job opportunities, improve the infrastructure of the institutions and recruit the truly deserving candidates in the Central Council.

DR. SHRIKANT EKNATH SHINDE: This amendment seeks to reduce redundancy by restructuring the Dental Council. There were widespread allegations on the functioning of the DCI and the autonomy enjoyed by it. If you go by the existing situation of dentists in our country, it seems the Dental Council of India has failed miserably. There is acute unemployment among dentists. Starting one's own practice requires huge finances. The major cause of

unemployment of dentists is mushrooming of dental colleges. The dental treatment should be included under the cashless health insurance scheme.

SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE: Nowhere in the world you get dental insurance. Today, probably one of the highest costs of medical treatment is in dental treatment. Every five hours, there is one death due to oral cancer in India and it is one of the highest in the world. Oral hygiene is one of the most important aspects in oral cancer. The doctors are excellent, the infrastructure is excellent but it is the access for each human being which needs to be taken care of. India does not take oral healthcare very seriously but today it is one of the largest causes of deaths and 35 per cent people die of oral cancer in this country. We need to bring this up with a big awareness programme.

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Dentistry started since 7000 B.C. and the first example of dentistry was found when a large number of tools were found from Harappa civilization which included equipments for removal of teeth also. It is a matter of serious concern whether we have Dentists in sufficient number for 125 crore people? There is only one Dentist for 8000 people in urban areas and for 1.5-3 lakh people in rural areas. Today, there are more private Dental colleges in India. There is need to spread the information about the technologies available with the local doctors. Every dentists is a surgeon also as he has to extract the teeth and then he has to undertake stitching also. Those who smoke cigarettes, have serious danger of mouth cancer for which there is lack of detection facility. The progress

in dentistry care in India will also improve the detection of oral cancer. Today, we have about Rs.1 lakh crore worth medical tourism in India and out of it about Rs.10000 crore is the share of dental health care. It is a good opportunity for Indian dental healthcare in the world. It is, therefore, requested that the Government should bring a comprehensive Oral Health Care Bill in future and the entire House will welcome it.

SHRI CHANDRA SEKHAR SAHU: On behalf of our Party, I support the proposed amendment in the Bill. A lot of dental colleges have come up. Dental care is required for everybody. I hope, with this amendment, the Dental Councils will be restructured and become more effective to deal with the challenges being faced by the Dental science sector, like severe shortage of dentists in the country. Government should take the initiative to set up more Government run dental colleges so that we will have more dentists in the country in the future. Demand for dental services will increase as the population ages. I would like to suggest if the hon. Minister could consider to have at least 2 to 3 Dentists from amongst the Members of Parliament in the Dental Council of India.

SHRI JAYADEV GALLA: While we support the Bill, we should improve the quality of various Dental Councils. I have two suggestions. One suggestion is to make it mandatory to have the medical and dental check-ups in the school itself so as to create a culture of looking after their health needs and dental needs. My second suggestions is to include dental care also in all PHCs in the country.

SHRIMATI VANGA GEETHA VISWANATH: We are happy for the introduction of Dentists Bill and the proposed amendment. I would like to request the hon. Minister on certain points. There should be increase in the number of representatives of dentists in Dental Council of India and State Dental Councils. Though oral health is included under non-communicable diseases but least priority is given to oral health awareness. I am very particular for oral health awareness camps to be conducted in the villages under National Health Mission. I request the hon. Minister that all Government schemes should lay stress on oral health awareness and focus on prevention rather than treatment of diseases. Sanction of new dental colleges should be stopped for at least few years because there is already a surplus production of dental doctors.

DR. SUBHAS SARKAR: We have 2.5 lakh qualified dental surgeons. There are only 950 dental surgeons registered under Part-B. It was so happening that 4-5 dental surgeons registered under Part-B used to become members of the Dental Council of India. There is no justification for them to be there in the Council. In the year 2011, colleges were sanctioned at mass scale. This led to corruption in the Council. In the period of only 10 years, as many as 264 private medical colleges were sanctioned but only 49 Government medical colleges were given permission. Everybody knows that how it became a business. Thereafter, in the period of last 8 years, only 21 medical colleges and 9 Government medical colleges have been sanctioned. Our Government has put a check on it. This

Amendment Bill seeks to bring in transparency in Dental Council and strengthen dental education. Every Primary Health Center at Block level should have a Dental Surgeon.

SHRI N.K. PREMACHANDRAN: Dental colleges are mushrooming like anything. Quality of dental education needs to be maintained. Dental protection and dental rehabilitation are required for maintaining the general health of a person. India is having the highest number of oral cancer patients that is ever increasing. If it is detected at a primary stage, it can effectively be cured. Given that, at least in the community health center, there should be allocation for the post of Dentists in order that oral cancer can be diagnosed at the primary stage. Besides, I would like to urge upon the hon. Health Minister to educate people and cause awareness among the people to avoid the incidence of oral cancer.

SHRI SANTOSH PANDEY: The way the Bill was brought in the year 1948 followed by certain amendments thereto has an ample room for amendment. It is urgently required. I hold the conviction that the Dental Council must be equipped with a robust infrastructure and sufficient number of teaching faculty other than ample resources as well as requisite equipment.

SHRI M. BADRUDDIN AJMAL: There is a huge shortfall of Dentists in the country and more so in the rural areas. If at all there are a few private Dentists, they are dispossessed of requisite machinery and equipment. Decaying of teeth can be largely attributed to contaminated water. The pathetic condition witnessed in

Haldihati located in Assam is a case in point. Dental profession needs to be given a fillip in the country as the nation is severely lacks qualified Dentists. Appointment of at least one or two Doctor in every Government hospitals should be made mandatory.

SHRI BHAGWANT MANN: As per the WHO norms, the ratio of patient and Dentist should be 1000:1 but here we have 20000:1 which is quite way off the mark. There is no awareness among the people about the ailments related to gums. It is interesting to note that the people of Punjab settled in the USA and Canada come to India for their dental treatment as the quality of treatment here is affordable and better. We can make it much better. As of now, we do not have dental insurance. Besides, proper emphasis has to be laid on Rural Dental Insurance.

DR. BHARATI PRAVIN PAWAR: The amendment will help restructure the Dental Council of India. Of course, there has been an increase in the level of awareness among people. There is a huge demand of Dental hygiene and cosmetic dentistry. The fact of the matter is that Dentists are rendering their services in the cities but the situation is pathetic in the rural areas. In my Constituency Dindori, there is no Dentist either in PHC or in RH in the rural areas. Dental services are not available to the children and senior citizens. An awareness camp for oral healthcare needs to be organized. The number of Under Graduate and Post

Graduate seats needs to be increased. I urge upon the Government to set up a Dental college in Nasik district.

***SHRI THOL THIRUMAAVALAVAN:**

SHRI ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY: I request the hon. Minister to do something so as to make public aware of using the toothbrush and paste. This can be added to the school curriculum. Secondly, the Government should provide for flouride fortification in the mid-day meal so that gums and dental health could be ensured right from the childhood. People's teeth are getting degraded because of the food habits. The Government should take action in this regard.

DR. HARSH VARDHAN *replying said:* The Bill has received huge support from all sides. An hon. Member has opposed the nomination process as provided by the amendment Bill. I would like to tell that the nominated members constitute a very small part in all the Councils and our Government functions on the basis of twin principles of full transparency and objectivity. A number of hon. Members have expressed concerns about the oral health care and oral cancer. I myself has been an ENT surgeon. During practice I developed a passion to work for tobacco free society. I know very well that we should take care of our teeth. I stand by the feelings expressed by all Members with regard to the functioning of the Dental Council of India. We wish that all these institutions work in public interest with full transparency and commitment. Many of you perhaps do not know that the oral

* Please see Supplement

health care has a very large component in the primary and secondary health care. The Government of India launched the National Oral Health Programme in the year 2014-15. All of you must be aware of this. You very well know that health is a State subject. So, if you sent proposals from your respective constituencies you can help the Government a lot in fixing the problems of the system to ensure oral health care. I can promise we will support you and try to strengthen every aspect of the National Health Mission. The hon. Prime Minister has launched the Ayushman Bharat Yojana. It has a secondary component also in which the emphasis has been laid on building the health and happiness clinics. It is a very ambitious programme. The Government has a target to set up 150000 clinics by the year 2022 and 18000 to 19000 health and wellness clinics have already been set up. All the persons who are above 20 years of age are having compulsory health check-ups there. It is the wish of the hon. Prime Minister that a people's movement should be developed in India with regard to health. I request you all to be health messengers in your respective constituencies and inspire the common people to lead their lives with a focus on positive health. With this, I appeal all of you to pass this Bill unanimously.

The Bill was passed.

**

**

**

**

SNEHLATA SHRIVASTAVA
Secretary General

**Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

© 2019 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debate of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopses of Lok Sabha Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>.