

LOK SABHA

SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES (Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Monday, February 3, 2020 / Magha 14, 1941 (Saka)

*MATTERS UNDER RULE 377

1. **SHRI NIHAL CHAND CHOUHAN** laid a statement regarding need to take remedial measures to tackle locust attack destroying crops in Rajasthan.
2. **SHRIMATI JASKAUR MEENA** laid a statement regarding need to shift Krishi Vigyan Kendra in Dausa Parliamentary Constituency, Rajasthan to a suitable place in the Constituency.
3. **SHRI RODMAL NAGAR** laid a statement regarding need to develop Mohanpura dam in Madhya Pradesh as a tourist place.
4. **SHRI S. MUNISWAMY** laid a statement regarding need to include Kolar Parliamentary Constituency in Jal Shakti Abhiyan Project.
5. **SHRI JAMYANG TSERING NAMGYAL** laid a statement regarding shortage of officers and staff in Union Territory of Ladakh.
6. **SHRI TEJASVI SURYA** laid a statement regarding need to ban

* Laid on the Table as directed by the Speaker/Chair.

organizations spreading terror in the country.

7. **KUNWAR PUSHPENDRA SINGH CHANDEL** laid a statement regarding need to develop historical Charkhari fort in Bundelkhand region of Uttar Pradesh.
8. **SHRI ANURAG SHARMA** laid a statement regarding disposal of e-waste.
9. **SHRI MUKESH RAJPUT** laid a statement regarding need to increase annual cash withdrawal limit from banks for retail traders to Rs.5 crore per year.
10. **SHRIMATI MALA RAJYA LAXMI SHAH** laid a statement regarding need to sanction funds for construction of railway line from Dehradun to Kalsi in Uttarakhand.
11. **SHRI SUSHIL KUMAR SINGH** laid a statement regarding need to restart Integrated Action Plan/Additional Central Assistance programme for Left Wing Extremism affected districts in the country.
12. **SHRI RAHUL KASWAN** laid a statement regarding need to allocate Rajasthan its due share of water for Sidhmukh Nohar Irrigation Project.
13. **SHRI MOHAN MANDAVI** laid a statement regarding need to ensure participation of Members of Parliament in decision making process for utilization of funds collected under District Mineral Foundation for

development works in Chhattisgarh.

14. **SHRIMATI RAKSHA NIKHIL KHADSE** laid a statement regarding need to extend benefit of Pradhan Mantri Gramin Awas Yojana to families found eligible in Jalgaon district, Maharashtra.
15. **SUSHRI S JOTHIMANI** laid a statement regarding shortage of funds under MGNREGA.
16. **SHRI RAJMOHAN UNNITHAN** laid a statement regarding need to create post of clinical pharmacist for Pharm. D. graduates.
17. **DR. T. SUMATHY(A) THAMIZHACHI THANGAPANDIAN** laid a statement regarding water problem of Tamil Nadu.
18. **SHRI BELLANA CHANDRA SEKHAR** laid a statement regarding need to increase pension amount under EPS 95.
19. **PROF. SOUGATA RAY** laid a statement regarding Citizenship Amendment Act.
20. **SHRI RAHUL RAMESH SHEWALE** laid a statement regarding need to formulate uniform policy addressing construction restrictions and buffer zones around Defence establishments.
21. **SHRI KAUSHLENDRA KUMAR** laid a statement regarding need to consider cultivation of betel leave as an agricultural activity and grant the status of 'farmer' to betel leave growers in Bihar.

22. **SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB** laid a statement regarding need to amend rules for CAMPA Funds.
23. **DR. G. RANJITH REDDY** laid a statement regarding need to promote poultry industry.
24. **SHRI CHANDAN SINGH** laid a statement regarding need to construct four lane road on National Highway-31 alongwith a Express Highway from Rajauli to Bakhtiyarpur in Nawada Parliamentary Constituency, Bihar.

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS

SHRI PARVESH SAHIB SINGH VERMA *moving the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address, said:* "That the Members of the Lok Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on January 31st, 2020."

In the previous tenure of five years from the year 2014 to 2019, the Government has done a fantastic job of laying the strong foundation in the country and hopefully, five years down the line, a strong architecture shall be erected thereon embodying the basic mantra of 'Sab Ka Saath, Sab Ka Vikas'. The people in the Opposition are teaching us Constitution today. I would like to take an

opportunity to show them an original copy of the Constitution containing the pictorial portrayal of Lord Ram, Goddess Sita and Bhaiya Laxman figuring above the Fundamental Rights in Part-III. By extension, coming to Part-IV comprising Directive Principles of State Policies contain a photograph wherein Lord Krishna is imparting Arjuna lessons from the religious texts the Gita. Subsequently, I would like to particularly show them the photograph of Hanuman in Chapter-VIII who is supposed to be an entity capable enough to bail us out of crisis. Does it in any way, mean that even this Constitution turned out to be a communal instrument. It is high time the youth of our nation should inspect these delineation and be made to think as to what prompted our great leaders to include the pictures of the divine entities in this Constitution. The fact of the matter is that these pictures do not symbolize any religion in particular. Lord Rama gives the message of humanity and teach us as to how to move forward in life upholding noble ideals. Over the last five years, our Government has solved many big problems by embarking on concrete solution at varying points in time. Article 370 of the Constitution has been repealed. Triple Talaq dispensation has become a thing of the past. Moving further, the Government has been pleased to cover more than 40 crore wage earners as well as small traders, farmers and others working in the unorganized sector under pension scheme. Under Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojana, Rs.6,000 is being credited into the account of farmers through DBT. There has been no

incidence of scam involving even a single rupee in our five years' tenure. Extension of medical treatment, insurance cover, free electric connection to the poor, and payment of loans under MUDRA Yojana speak volumes of good governance. This Government functions being guided by the inclusive spirit of Sarva Dharma Sambhava. This is reflected in full measure on the ground as well. To substantiate, where on one hand intensive efforts were made to construct Ram Mandir at Ayodhya, the same degree of diligence and initiatives were made to increase the quota for the Haz pilgrims in India on the other. We did celebrate 550th Prakash Utsav dedicated to Guru Nanak Dev with much fanfare. It has been during this regime only that work in respect of Kartar Saheb corridor got commenced and is very much in currency. We came up with 'Jiyo Parsi' Scheme for the Persians. The Government taking rapid strides on economic front to actualize the dream of entering the economic trajectory of five trillion dollar. Our international ranking has witnessed substantial increase thanks to a slew of landmark decisions like IBC, Fugitive Economic Offender Law, GST, RERA merger of banks etc. In the ease of doing business ranking, resolving insolvency and global innovation. Our ranking has improved significantly. The innovative steps like Startup India, 4th Industrial Revolution, Artificial Intelligence, Quantum Computing, Internet of things are also attributed to our Government. Naxalite activities have also considerably come down over the last five years. The culprits

of 1984 Sikh riots are languishing in jail. Air pollution is a big problem facing all of us. The Government has taken a definitive step with the inclusion of National Climate Action Plan in the Union Budget. As many as 1731 unauthorised colonies have been regularized in Delhi. Capital Gains chargeable from those selling their properties have also been waived off. Sanction has been accorded for the construction of Metro rail phase IV. Our Government is committed to providing safe drinking water to every citizen of the country by the year 2024. No household including those in Delhi shall be bereft of clean drinking water by the year 2024. Neither a single new flyover has been constructed in Delhi, nor inaugurated by the Chief Minister of Delhi. The present Government in Delhi delayed the phase 4 project of metro but the Chief Minister of Delhi spent as much as 1400 crores of rupees on advertisements. Therefore, the development of Delhi is there in newspapers, TV advertisements and through the words of the Chief Minister of Delhi only. The residents of Delhi are not able to see and perceive the development on the ground. The Chief Minister of Delhi did not give the necessary permission for trial of the 'tukde tukde' gang during past one and a half years. Our Union Government implemented Ayushman Bharat Scheme across the country, but it was not implemented in Delhi. Similarly, several central schemes were not implemented in Delhi. As many as 15700 posts of teachers are lying vacant. There is a shortage of as many as 900 buses. Just after the formation

of our government at the centre, our hon. Prime Minister gave a *pucca* house in place of every jhuggi across Delhi. An international convention center with a cost of Rs. 26,000 crore is proposed to be constructed in Delhi by the Union Government. Our Government also imparted skill training to three lakh youths in the skill development centers. A hundred bed hospital with a cost of Rs. 100 crore is going to be set up in my Parliamentary Constituency of Najafgarh. Finally, I would like to make an humble request that governments will come and go, but we all have to work together to make India a treasure trove again. I support the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address in its entirety.

SHRI RAM KRIPAL YADAV *seconding the Motion moved by Shri Parvesh Sahib Singh Verma, said:* His Excellency, the President has reverentially mentioned the names of all great national leaders of India after independence who have made their contribution in the development of the country and in strengthening the democracy. I can say with conviction that our hon. Prime Minister has imbibed the views and ideals of all those great leaders and has also translated them into reality during the last five years. When this Government was formed in the year 2014, in about more than 10 crore houses there were no toilets. Six lakh villages were not free from open defecation. About two crore *pucca* houses were not there. About eight crore women did not have gas connections. About 38 crore poor people did not have bank accounts. In more than two and a

half crore homes, there were no electricity connections. About 18,000 villages did not have electricity. About 50 crore people did not have the facility of free treatment upto five lakh rupees. More than five crore fifty four lakh entrepreneurs were given loans to the tune of 10 lakh crores of rupees under the MUDRA Scheme. About 24 crore people did not have insurance cover and about 1,34,000 village panchayats did not have optical fibre and broadband facility. About eight crore seventy eight lakh farmers did not have the benefit under the Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojana. Our hon. Prime Minister conceived and executed several new schemes to provide the benefits to the poor. In fact, with the effective implementation of the schemes, the last man standing in the queue has been benefited. Our government has got unflinching commitment towards the villages, the poor and the farmer. The CAA has been implemented under the relevant legal provisions and the Parliament itself has passed it. But, today the Constitution is being thrown to the wind and demonstrations are being held with copies of the Constitution. Which are these forces? There is a need to keep an eye on them. I would like to say to our brothers belonging to the minority community that I have been associated with you for very long and have also served you. I would, therefore, urge upon you to please have faith in the leadership of our hon. Prime Minister as he will bring about qualitative improvement in your lives. Hon. Prime Minister has introduced schemes for empowerment of all sections of the society

and all women. The Government enacted a law to ban the practice of triple *Talaq*. Hon. Prime Minister thinks of 130 crore Indians and does not discriminate against any. He wants to make our economy a five trillion economy by the year 2024. Today, the atmosphere of the country is being vitiated. The Government should try to know if there is any international conspiracy in this. The Opposition should not oppose the Constitution in the name of opposing the Prime Minister. Several states have stated that they would not implement CAA. How will the Constitution and the democracy be saved like that? Whatever the Government is doing was promised to the people of the country in our manifesto. The schemes which were pending have been brought on the track. Hon. Prime Minister is working with a firm commitment. I urge you all to extend constructive support to the Government. I, again, thank H.E. the President for his Address to both the Houses.

SHRI P.K. KUNHALIKUTTY: The Address of the President has been quite disappointing. It does not address any of problems that the country faces. It seems that the ruling party does not at all bothered about the development of the country or the problems it is facing with. Delhi election is the best example to show what they are doing in the whole of the country. During the UPA Government, the GDP was growing whereas it has come down during the last five years. The value of rupee has gone down. Unemployment is at its maximum. Poverty is also growing. This speech of the President does not address any of the

issues at all. We are going down in the Democratic Index. There are issues like CAA, NRC and NPR. They are not bothered about the agitations that are going on. A number of Chief Ministers have said that they would not implement it and the Government is not bothered about the federal system. The situation which prevails in this country is very serious.

SHRI GAURAV GOGOI: We are discussing today the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address but what we are seeing is empty chairs in the House. Today, the people are out on the streets defending the values of the Constitution. That is democracy. The Ruling Party has this confusion that just because they have won an election, the democracy is over. Democracy is when people of India understand the true meaning of freedom and the values on which independent India was founded. Today, we have heard inflammatory statements being made about Mahatma Gandhi but no action has been taken against the person. We had to walk out when the leading speaker stood up to speak because he has been banned from campaigning by the Election Commission. For winning an election, the Government has kept at bay all the problems facing the country. Today we have to save the ideas of India, its Constitution alongwith its ideas of freedom. Let us have a discussion about who the real enemies of the people of India are. It is unemployment and it is inequality. Let us get away from the politics of poison and hate and let us get into the politics of hope. However, this Government with its

hate is taking India back. So, please take us forward. That is my only sincere request to you. Again, I would like to say that people want a good economy and this is the Budget that this Government has gave us. I would like to ask whether this Budget will reverse the highest unemployment in the last four decades? The lowest GDP was in the last six years. So, this Government's entire economy and vision are empty and devoid. This Government is giving relief by corporate tax but farmers are not getting any relief. So, I would like to tell that we will only help our Indian economy grow if we invest in rural India. It is only when rural India grows, the rest of India grows. But I do not know why the Government has failed to see this. We come here for five years and for five years, our responsibility is to develop a good Government. If we do not fulfil our responsibility, then there is no point of that power. My faith is that in the end, neither you nor I, but it is the people of India who will lead the way forward.

SHRI T.R. BAALU: I rise to thank the Hon. President who has delivered the President's Address on the 31st of last month. When the President addresses both the Houses of Parliament, he has to read the address supplied by the Government of India. We know that. That is what he has done but he has not gone through it thoroughly whether the things which have been inside the President's Address are true or not. He has not testified it. He stated that by 2022, the income of farmers will be doubled. But where is the chance for doubling the farmers'

income? In my district, we are not getting crop loan and crop insurance even today. The farmers are not having proper irrigation infrastructure. The Government is not providing proper market for the farmers' produce. Similarly, this Government has not made any attempt to implement Swaminathan's Report. Again, oppressed people are not getting social justice even today. They are exploited and there is no relief to them. Similarly, this Government has issued a Tender Notice inviting Expression of Interest or Petroleum Blocks in the Cauvery Delta districts of Thanjavur, Tiruchirappalli, Pudukkottai, Nagappattinam, Tiruvarur and Cuddalore. In this regard, I would like to ask whether it is correct on the part of the Government? Whether the petroleum blocks could be bided for oil exploration in the delta area. The Delta farmers are suffering. Around 122 lakh people are living in these six districts. This Government has offered 274 blocks to the private agencies. I would like to know whether any cost-benefit ratio has been identified. It is not even one per cent. I would also like to know that what is the compulsion for bringing CAA? This Government has got established law. This Government wants to discriminate people. In the NPR, whatever data this Government collected is wide open to the world. That is why, we hate the NPR. Similarly, according to the Universal Declaration article 215, it is for the government to give asylum to each and every body world over whoever comes, whichever caste, creed or religion he belongs. India is one of the signatories of the Universal Declaration. So, with this, I

only tell to go slow and also try to accommodate everybody in the world. Afterall, we are all kith and kin.

SUSHRI MAHUA MOITRA: This Government has betrayed the very citizens who voted for it. This Government did not come to power on the vote of the Hindu-right alone; it came to power because of a very large sections of ordinary people. But it has betrayed the young voter who was eagerly looking forward to his first job. It has betrayed the small businessmen by its foolish decision of demonetisation. This Government has betrayed thousands of tribal people in Gujarat whose land it took to build a staute and to whom it has given jobs as toilet cleaners. The NPR, the NRC and the CAA are all tools in this Machiavellian design to first mark out, then disenfranchise, and finally annihilate. This is its biggest betrayal of those who voted for it. This Government has betrayed people's mandate. My words will be incomplete if I do not highlight the abysmal state of the economy. The Finance Minister is fearful of putting out the real GDP growth target. Between 2011-12 and 2017-18 per capita consumption, according to the National Sample Survey dropped in real terms. This is unprecedented in modern times. A bigger problem may be that our way to compute the GDP of the informal sector is crude and backward looking. So, we overestimate the GDP when the informal sector is shrinking. The Chief Economic Advisor has gone now on record to say that all the more reliable measures of macro statistics, such as

growth in exports, import and credit, investment, vehicle sales are mostly negative. If we are really in crisis the Government is doing this country a huge disservice by trying to suppress data and denying the correctness of the data that exists.

SHRI P.V. MIDHUN REDDY: To start with, I would like to reiterate that our Party is opposed to NRC and even NPR. We request the Government to reconsider the questionnaire in NPR also so that there is no insecurity in the minority community. Andhra Pradesh is a new State. We have been asking for special category status. It was promised on this very floor of the House. We have been asking for implementing all the points in the AP Reorganisation Act. We also request the Government to act on Revenue Deficit Grant. The C & AG has pegged revenue deficit of Rs. 22,900 crore. So far, it has not been fulfilled. The most important project of our state, the Polavaram project is going at a brisk pace, and it is going to be completed in one-year time. We request the Central Government to release funds in time, and release it in every 15 days' time because for the past six months Rs. 5,000 crore has been pending to our State for the Polavaram project, but till today the funds have not been released. We want hon. Prime Minister to take credit for doing the Polavaram project in time and helping the State of Andhra Pradesh. We would also request the Government to keep its word and help in setting up the Kadapa Steel Plant. Further, a Ramayapatnam Port was promised. M/s RITES has come out with a Techno-Economic Feasibility Report where it is

mentioned that it is viable. Hence, We would request the Government to come forward for it. One area or State cannot be excluded, and without supporting a State we cannot dream or aspire to be a \$ 5 trillion economy.

SHRI VINAYAK BHAURAO RAUT: Old schemes and announcements of the Government have been repeated in the President's Address but no change is visible in the way of their implementation. According to the census about 12.5 crore households are living below the poverty line. It is very natural that the dream project of the Prime Minister, Ujjwala Scheme should have reached those 12 crore households but unfortunately it had reached only 8 crore households. The Government has run short of funds to provide gas connections under the Ujjwala Scheme. Mere announcements are not going to lead the country towards prosperity but the need of the hour is to deliver on the announcements in a proper manner. I am constrained to say that we supported the Government in the matters of the Article 370 and 35A. But I would like to know about how many Indians have successfully started their business in Kashmir following the scraping of Article 370 and 35A. We would also like to know the name of the districts in which Government proposes to open the proposed Eklavya Residential Schools in the country. The Government may please state the number of refugees from Pakistan, Bangladesh and Afghanistan living in India. The Government should make efforts to contain the problems like price-rise, burgeoning unemployment and incidents of violence

against the women and children instead of misleading the country in the name of NRC. Today, crores of people are not getting the agricultural connection for agriculture. BSNL has been completely shut down in the country today. The D-List of Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana has not been implemented till date.

SHRI PINAKI MISRA: Odisha has now been hit by almost five severe cyclones in the last eight years which has caused incalculable damage to property and infrastructure. But, hon. President's Address does not find mention of a special focus to be given to Odisha. The original 14th Finance Commission devolution to Odisha was Rs. 48,000 crore which has come down to Rs. 30,000 crore in the present budget. In the last five months, Odisha has got nothing by way of our share of the GST compensation. We are a State where maximum mining takes place and we have been asking to give us a clean energy cess but we have so far not succeeded on this issue. We asked for coal royalty revision but that is not happening. Odisha is a repository of the 2000 years old Kalinga civilization but not a single site has been taken up as a archaeological site. We have a 38 per cent tribal population and we do not get a tribal museum. We have a very large OBC population but we still do not have their actual number. Hence, I urge the Government to kindly ensure OBC enumeration as nobody in the country at the moment knows what are the OBC numbers. There has been an increased allotment on rural housing. Recently, the Prime Minister has personally said that he is going

to look into many of the stalled railway projects in the State. We are grateful for it. The largest revenue is given by Odisha to the Indian Railways but we hardly get a fraction of that back. I urge the Government to give special grants to make Puri a world class city so that it becomes the Cultural Capital.

SHRI RITESH PANDEY: I would like to ask the government which equal opportunity we are talking about when the unemployment has reached its peak in 45 years and there has been a huge decline in the purchasing power of the common man? By giving government jobs on contract basis, the government has snatched the rights of dalits, backwards and tribals. Hon. President had also said that a new India would be established which will play a pioneer role in the fourth industrial revolution but the bitter truth is that India has already lagged behind in this race. The government has not formulated any single policy in the last six years to enable us to compete with China, USA and EU in the fourth industrial revolution. This country does not need the divisive and unconstitutional laws likes CAA and NRC. The country needs a positive, peaceful and progressive leadership.

SHRI JASBIR SINGH GILL: I do not agree at all with the hon. President's Address. There was nothing in it for the loan waiver for the farmers of Punjab. The number of cancer patients has risen tremendously in Punjab. All the MPs of Punjab have had been demanding for a cancer institute there but even that we haven't got which is most important for our health. Three railway projects have

been pending since long in Punjab. There has been no mention of Patti-Ferozpur railway line, Beas-Kadiyan railway line and two laning of Bhatinda-Chandigarh line. There is tax-rebate and tax-incentives for industries in the neighbouring States of Punjab. A large number of our industries have shifted there. Punjab should also be provided these tax incentives. Not a single rupee has been provided by the government on the occasion of Guru Nanak Sahib's 550th birth anniversary. This is gross injustice to us. Today, the government wants to privatize Bharat Petroleum, Hindustan Petroleum, Air India, BSNL. It is my submission that keeping our PSUs alive is very important to keep the prices in check. We want freedom from unemployment, from diseases and from illiteracy.

**

**

**

**

SNEHLATA SHRIVASTAVA
Secretary General

**Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

© 2020 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debate of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopses of Lok Sabha Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>.