

# LOK SABHA

---

## SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES (Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

---

Friday, February 8, 2019 / Magha 19, 1940 (Saka)

---

### SUBMISSION BY MEMBERS

*Re: Rafale deal*

**THE MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT, MINISTER OF PANCHAYATI RAJ, MINISTER OF MINES AND MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI NARENDRA SINGH TOMAR)**

*responding to the issue raised by several hon. Members, said:* The Opposition had sought discussion on Rafael and the Hon. Minister of Defence gave a point-wise reply and the truth was established after threadbare discussion. Hon. Supreme Court has also given its verdict in this regard. Interrupting the proceedings of the House and the Budget of the country by quoting a newspaper report is not fair from any angle. The news report which the Opposition Members are waving is not correct. Hon. Minister of Defence is present here and would give her statement.

**THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN)** *also responding said:* When the newspaper itself has chosen to say or point out in detail the then Defence Secretary's comment which was meant for the attention of the then Raksha Mantri on record it should have also put the

reply of the Raksha Mantri which was also given in writing. The Opposition Leaders who want a reply should now know what was the reply of the then Raksha Mantri. The then Raksha Mantri had very clearly said in response to the file noting of the then Defence Secretary to remain calm, there is nothing to worry and things are going all right. I would like to remind the House that during my reply on 4<sup>th</sup> January, 2019, I had very clearly pointed out this particular allegation also about the suspected interference by the PMO and when periodically, PMO enquires about the progress of any work, that cannot be construed as inference. Therefore, every question on Rafale is over and done with answer. The Opposition parties are like what the Hon. Prime Minister said yesterday playing into the hands of multinational corporations and with vested interest keeping the issue alive. They are not interested in the Indian Air Force getting powerful. They are damaging this country.

### **THE INTERIM BUDGET-2019-20**

### **DEMANDS FOR GRANTS ON ACCOUNT-2019-20**

**AND**

### **SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS-2018-19**

**SHRI TATHAGATA SATPATHY** *initiating said:* I do not hold any one party responsible for the plight of India today. All that this Government has done is actually completely follow in the misdeeds and the bad *modus operandi* of the Congress. All the new laws that the Government has made in this country like

changing the company affairs law, changing the banking system, demonetization etc. have been aimed at only the super big industrialists. They have never bothered to check what a farmer wants. Will six thousand rupee a year suffice to help a farmer to survive? The Government has done nothing for the Start-ups, nothing for small businesses. It has virtually scrapped the Five Year Plan. No country can possibly grow if there is no mid-range and long-range planning of growth. They have no Vision Document for 15 years nor has their Three Year Action Plan any structured road map. The three year document is toothless because it has no financial powers. Since it needs no Cabinet approval, its recommendations are not binding on the Government. Even after five years, the Government is still blaming the Congress and they are not progressing beyond blaming. A time has come that they should stop blaming. The people had voted them in 2014 to break the evil of the Congress. So, by blaming them, they have not done anything good for the country. Rather it is necessary that we get out of the old mindset and create a system where we do not blame each other but we think of the nation. The Government boasts of giving the middle class a tax exemption of five lakh rupees per annum. But, actually if somebody gets even ten rupees above five lakh rupees, the whole amount of five lakh rupees will come under the tax system. Will it really help the middle class assesseees? They are giving 10 per cent reservation to the EBC, Economical Backward Class, of the upper castes with eight lakh rupees as their cut off annual income. Therefore, with this kind of a reservation, will the

beneficiaries of this reservation be tax-payers? The Government is constantly contradicting itself.

**SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR:** This Budget is meant for building a new India. This Budget is going to benefit more than 3.5 crore middle class families, more than 12 crore farmers and more than 30 crore workers. It will enhance the purchasing power of the middle class. In 2014, a report of IMF had mentioned the poor economic performance of India. But, just four years after it, the IMF report of 2018 stated that India is the fastest growing economy among the emerging economies. I would like to present some data before the House. In the last 67 years, rural sanitation was only 38 per cent which has increased to 95 per cent under our Government. Gas connections were only 55 per cent which have been increased to more than 95 per cent. The Congress Government had opened 50 per cent bank accounts in 67 years while we have opened 100 per cent bank accounts in less than five years. Today, about 50 per cent Gram Panchayats have been connected with optical fibre. In the last 67 years, 3,80,000 kilometers of roads were built but in these four years two lakh kilometers of roads have been added. FDI, which was 36 billion US dollars in 2013-14, has increased to 61.96 billion US dollars. Our Government's achievements in 55 months are many times more than what they had achieved in 55 years. Global performance of India has improved and we are now ranked 77<sup>th</sup> in Ease of Doing Business from our previous rank of 142<sup>nd</sup>. Interface in the Income Tax Department is being done away with.

Presenting the budget, our hon. Finance Minister mentioned middle class tax payers whose hard work augmented the tax collections leading to the development of the poor people. This indicates how our government has worked for the common men and honoured the tax payers. Yesterday, the people from the Congress Party were saying as to what purpose will be fulfilled with such a meagre amount of Rs. 6000. As far as the loan waiver scheme implemented by the Congress Party is concerned, nepotism and plundering of the fund were rampant there and the same has been corroborated in detail in the report of CAG. 700 farmers committed suicide in 700 days in Punjab. Who are responsible for the suicides committed by those 700 farmers? None else but the people who made false promises compelled them to commit suicide. The Congress Party made a provision of Rs. 500 crore in order to implement One Rank One Pension in the entire country. Was such a meagre amount of Rs. 500 crore sufficient to provide One Rank One Pension to lakhs of ex-servicemen. It was Modi Government who delivered on its promises by providing Rs. 35,000 crore for this purpose. I am glad to share with all of you that our Government has taken initiatives to set up new department for the development of fisheries. This move is going to benefit about 1.5 crore fishermen. All the BJP ruled States have reduced the prices of petrol and diesel and hence, I would like to ask a question to the Congress Party as to why the Congress ruled States have not reduced so far the prices of petrol and diesel. Our Government has made a budgetary provision to provide a pension of

Rs. 3000 to the poor workers of unorganized sector when they attain the age of 60 years. About more than 40 crore workers of unorganized sector are going to be benefitted from this move. We have successfully implemented Pradhan Mantri Jan Dhan Yojana. The Modi Government has saved Rs. 90,000 crore from being plundered by bringing transparency and fixing the accountability of the Government through the Direct Benefit Transfer. Our Government has spent more than Rs. 60,000 crore on MGNREGA. I am also happy to state that now the people having the income of Rs. 5 lakh will not have to pay any income tax and I am very thankful to the hon. Finance Minister for that. Moreover, the Government along with the Supreme Court will continue to make efforts for getting returned the thousand crores of rupees to the lakhs of people whose hard earned money has been embezzled by the companies like Narda, Sharda and Rose Valley. Our Government has provided the facility of 10 per cent reservation to the poor of the upper castes without tinkering with the existing provisions of reservation for SC, ST and OBC. We have made efforts to provide impetus to innovations through Atal Innovation Scheme. Today, the efforts made by our hon. Prime Minister coupled with the hard work of the youth placed India among the first three Start-up nations of the world. We have converted the Look East policy of the Congress Party for the North-East into Act-East policy. Not only that we have increased the budgetary provision by 21 per cent to Rs. 58,260 crore for North-East. Besides, our Government has launched the largest healthcare scheme of the world the

Ayushman Bharat in the country. Apart from this, the defence allocation has also been increased by Rs. 3000 crore. Moreover, all-out efforts have been made to strengthen our defence forces. We have driven back China from Doklam. We can say boldly that we want cordial relationship with China, we want to increase trade with it. But, at the same time we want to leave no stone unturned to further strengthen our country and defence forces. Our Government has laid a foundation of new and vibrant India by dint of its uprightness, hard work and effective policies. Over five crore people came out of poverty line during this Government regime. In 2014 our economy was globally ranked on 11<sup>th</sup> position. I am glad to state that now India has become 6<sup>th</sup> largest economy of the world and I have a firm belief that this year India is likely to become 5<sup>th</sup> largest economy. As far as national optical fibre network is concerned, Government has connected approximately 50 per cent villages with this network. The Government is likely to connect all the Panchayats with this network by the end of this year. In all, Government has connected approximately one lakh 66 thousand villages with this network. Similarly, this Government has extended Nangal-Una-Talwara rail line upto Chintapurni Marg. Apart from that, survey work pertaining to Una-Hamirpur rail line has also been completed. This Government has announced a new rail line between Bhanupalli-Bilaspur-Manali-Leh. I would like to congratulate this Government for bringing a good Budget for the welfare of poor, marginalized and all sections of this country.

**SHRI T. G. VENKATESH BABU:** With the Budget 2019-20, the Centre it seems has at least moved closer to Sabka Sath, Sabka Vikas which is inclusive growth. There is direct income support to 12 crore small and medium farmers, tax exemptions to three crore middle class salaried employees. There is pension scheme for 40 crore unorganized workers. Further, the housing related tax proposals can give a leg-up to the real estate sector. The MUDRA loan extended to MSME industries will boost up that sector resulting in more jobs. The Ujjwala Yojana connected six crore LPGs. Similarly, a cow welfare scheme with a corpus fund of Rs.750 crore has been launched. Comparatively the average fiscal deficit has fallen to 3.7 per cent compared to 5.3 per cent during UPA 2 regime. The ratio of external debt to GDP has also fallen from 23.9 per cent to 20.85 per cent. Foreign exchange reserves being comfortable at 393 billion dollars and have touch the all-time high of 435 billion dollars. The Government has sincerely attempted to raise the Minimum Support Price. It has stepped into doubling the farm income in 2022. This Government has taken some efforts in implementing the recommendations of M.S. Swaminathan Committee recommendations. At the same time, the food processing and the food product preservation units have not adequately matched with the increased production. The availability of institutionalized credit to all farmers is still a pipe dream. The irrigation facilities augmenting the availability of adequate water and the modern techniques for the optimum utilizes of water are a far cry. I wish to point some of the grey areas of

this Budget which can be corrected by the future Government. The official data for 2017-18 readied in December, 2018 by the National Sample Survey has predicted a sharp rise in unemployment. The launch of jobs in the MSME sector due to demonetization and the GST is yet to recover. GST is another worrying area affecting the resources of the State especially the manufacturing States like Tamil Nadu. Out of Rs.90,000 crore allotted to the States as their share in GST in 2018, only Rs.51,736 crore has been realized. GST growth is expected to grow 25 per cent for the next financial year but given the fact that growth was less than seven per cent for the last six months. Another area of concern is the friction between the Centre and the RBI.

**SHRI DUSHYANT CHAUTALA:** After five years, provision pertaining to annual assistance of mere rupee six thousand has been made in this Budget. As far as education sector is concerned, Government has not increased the percentage of GDP to be spent on this sector. The Government has also not mentioned anything about sports in this Budget. I would like to request the Government that data obtained from satellite system should be used for the welfare of farmers and fishermen. Large scale computerization and automation by private companies have resulted in joblessness. Similarly, Skill India and Make-in-India programme have failed. The Government has not seriously considered about constructing dams and interlinking of rivers in this Budget. Apart from that, Smart City scheme has also not been implemented successfully. Government should streamline the

process of filing GST and income tax. I would like to express my gratitude to the Government for setting up 22<sup>nd</sup> AIIMS in Haryana.

*The discussion was not concluded.*

---

## **PRIVATE MEMBER'S BILL**

### **TOURISM PROMOTION CORPORATION OF INDIA BILL, 2015 - Contd.**

**SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY** *resuming said:* Expenditure on infrastructure has been the highest during the last 4-4.5 years of this Government. Better connectivity promotes tourism. Approximately, 20 million domestic and foreign tourists visit our country every year. Tourism contributes approximately 7 per cent to the GDP of our country. The countries which promoted tourism, have progressed. Indian culture is thousands and lakhs of years old. Kumbh in Prayagraj has been organized in the best way this year. This is a good example of religious tourism. The Mandar mountain used in *Samudra Manthan* lies in my Parliamentary Constituency. Most of children in the country may not be aware of it. Raj Mahal fossils are there in the same area. These fossils date back approximately 19-20 crore years. This spot should be developed as a tourist destination. The Ganges flow northwards at Sultanganj. 4-5 crore tourists visit this place every year. There is a *Shakti Peeth* at Deoghar. Infrastructure at all these places should be developed. Rail line from Sultanganj to Deoghar was

sanctioned in the year 1998 but has not been constructed till date. There has been a long standing demand for a rail line from Madhupur to Giridih, Giridih to Parasnath and Parasnath to Madhuban since 1972 but nothing has happened. Infrastructure should be developed at Bhagalpur, Champapuri, Nalanda, Taxila, Vikramshila also. The object of this Bill is to develop infrastructure. It seems that tourism has never been an important subject for our Governments. Establishment of this corporation shall facilitate promotion of tourism in the country. There has been huge development at Varanasi, Amritsar and Dharamshala. All tourist places should be developed on the same pattern. If we develop infrastructure of all the hilly states, Switzerland like tourism potential can be in place over there. Tourism is also a means of cultural exchange between one another. An office must be set up to deliver the information about the hotels to stay and which festival is being celebrated and the time by when it is being celebrated. Corporation should be headed by a Director General. Corporation should have a corpus fund of atleast Rs. 5000 crore. This fund should be like MGNREGA, should be demand driven. About 4-5 crores of devotees visit in my Parliamentary Constituency every year for *darshan* of Deoghar temple. If you wish that this devotees also visit surrounding tourist places, you should construct good roads and hotels also. A target should be fixed for next 20-25 years and infrastructure should be developed accordingly. Corporation shall formulate a tourism policy in consultation with the State Governments. The roots of Hindutva, Sikhism, Jainism or Buddhism is in Bihar

but there is not proper infrastructure in Bihar and Jharkhand. There should be a proper policy and programmes to protect and publicize the tourist sites of historical and cultural importance. Also wide publicity should be given to its policy and programmes through all means of communication including print and electronic media. All tourist places must be connected through road rail and air by developing proper infrastructure. Proper security is not being provided to our domestic and foreign tourists. A rate of bus, taxi, auto rickshaw should be fixed so that tourist can't be cheated. Tourist facilitation centers at all airports and railway stations should be set up so that they can book air tickets, train and bus tickets and hotels also. Tourism industry is the largest job provider. No country can develop without tourism. I would like to request the Government to consider and pass this Bill.

\*\*

\*\*

\*\*

\*\*

**SNEHLATA SHRIVASTAVA**  
*Secretary General*

---

\*\*Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

© 2019 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debates of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

*English and Hindi versions of Synopsis of Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>.*